



Book Reviews

Managing African Portugal: The Citizen-Migrant Distinction. *Keisha Fikes.* Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2009. 224 pp.

DAMANI J. PARTRIDGE

University of Michigan

In Keisha Fikes's engaging ethnography, *Managing African Portugal*, she offers a detailed account of how European Union accession has meant the production of the social, political, and economic distinction between migrants and citizens. In particular, this distinction is characterized by the loss of the myth of social intimacy inherent in "Lusotropicalism," an ideal that flowed in the colonial era from Brazil to Portugal and also included the former African colonies; at least in part, it envisioned the Portuguese miscegenation as proof of antiracism. In a postcolonial social and political economy in which "miscegenation [has now been] interrupted," Fikes shows how contemporary Lusophone life is characterized by new forms of racialization, in which the "African" in Portugal becomes a migrant as opposed to a citizen, and the space for mixing disappears.

Fikes investigates this process through the lives of Cape Verdian fish mongers who reside in Lisbon. Cape Verdians, she reveals, are not the ideal typical Africans in Portuguese colonial history. Unlike other African colonials, they were not only socially and racially ambiguous (reflecting one version of the Lusotropical fantasy), but they were also legally considered to be Portuguese citizens. Fikes's account is largely a story of becoming unambiguously Other.

With the move toward European modernity, also marked by the postcolonial move to the Portuguese metropole, the Portuguese citizenship of Cape Verdians ultimately fades. The citizen-migrant distinction, then, becomes a process of mutual constitution. The new Portuguese citizen needs the African domestic to become a "white" European, just as the emerging status of European-ness produces the now unambiguously African subject as the tolerated migrant.

By focusing on the scene of the informal fish markets from the mid-1990s to the mid-2000s, Fikes shows the development of this process as part of the concrete articulations of racism and citizenship in everyday European life. In

this instance, the reader sees the extent to which becoming European also means becoming middle class. This becoming requires social and economic distance from the African migrant. It also requires massive European investment and policing.

The policing that Fikes describes, however, comes not in the form of explicit border control (those marked as racially Portuguese also move from the former colony to the metropole) but, rather, in the regulation and criminalization of the African fish mongers, *peixarias*, women who must wake up in the middle of the night to buy fresh fish from Portuguese wholesalers, and then sell the fish from temporary stands to middle-class, wealthy, and poor Portuguese and African buyers near train stations, bus stations, and sea ports in urban Portugal. With the implementation of European norms, however, this practice (originally carried out primarily by Portuguese men and women) comes to be seen as unhygienic, illegal, and African. As European social and economic investment in standardized and regulated processing facilities and major grocery stores become the norm, police begin to regulate the symbolic stench of the unregulated urban fish scenes. African women who also had part-time second jobs as urban domestics, janitors, or kitchen help must calculate running from the police as part of their regular business practice. They sustain racialized verbal injury from the police, street sweepers, and Portuguese drug addicts who compete both for social legitimacy and urban space, the same spaces in which the *peixarias* hide their fish to make quick escapes from uniformed authority possible.

In part, Fikes explains, the second jobs the *peixarias* hold as domestics, janitors, or kitchen help become requirements for legal Portuguese residency. Portuguese employers must guarantee at least a year's worth of employment in order for those now increasingly viewed as "migrants" to get legal permission to stay in the country. With the moves toward democracy, modernity, and European accession, those from the former colonies who don't sustain residency in Portugal ultimately forfeit their formal Portuguese citizenship (from one generation to the next) if they cannot prove racialized Portuguese heritage. Thus, residency permits become part of the social, legal, and economic regulation of the migrant-citizen distinction. In the process of the move toward European modernity, Portugal becomes

a country of immigration as opposed to a place people primarily leave.

In the end, Fikes shows how the criminalization of peixarias spaces via discourses of hygiene and European becoming lead the African women from economic flexibility and the possibilities of greater wealth, to full-time, low-wage domesticated labor. Here, the citizen-migrant distinction is concretized as “white” (now middle-class) Portuguese women take on managerial roles (sometimes as owners of homes with African domestic “help”) but also as bank employees who instruct the African cleaning staff or supervisors of janitorial (largely African) crews.

Through Fikes’s ethnography, the reader sees how the Europeanized demands to distinguish the citizen from the migrant not only make possible a new vision of the Portuguese citizen as “white” and middle class but also forces the “African migrant” away from economic independence and out of public space. She must now exist in the background, effectively with a much lower earning potential. Her presence, though, helps to define the terms of what the new ideals of Europeanized Portuguese citizenship are not. If she is a waged laborer, the Portuguese citizen is middle class. If her residency status is tenuous, the Portuguese citizen’s is secure. If her ability to make political demands is uncertain, the Portuguese citizen’s is a foregone conclusion. While Fikes argues these distinctions serve as ideals and not always as realities, the ideals have material consequences.

Fikes concludes her study with the words of a former African peixarias turned domestic:

Remember those times, when I used to carry all that weight of fish!? GOD HELP ME!!!!!!!!!! We fought those policemen every day!? And we stood up to people who put us down. What a lifetime ago That was REAL work, those were different days, Portugal is a different place today. . . . I guess we’re stuck with it . . . poor, immigrant, it’s just that kind of fight, you know? You keep going . . . what else does one do? [p. 164]

Fikes’s next study might begin to answer these questions. What does one do? Is the African or “Other” noncitizen ultimately destined for a life without any future fight? As anthropologists, do we have any role beyond revealing this resignation and the process that led up to it?

Legalizing Identities: Becoming Black or Indian in Brazil’s Northeast. *Jan Hoffman French.* Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2009. 256 pp.

LIVIO SANSONE

Federal University of Bahia, Brazil

When doing research on racial hierarchies and ethnic identities in Brazil one is told over and again that, opposite to

the United States where identities and racial identifications are, as it were, given with birth, in Brazil one is not born black or *índio* but becomes so. Of course, the popular and erudite comparison of the racial and ethnic situation in the United States and Brazil is an academic field of its own and, in many ways, there is much to be said to the uniqueness of Brazil as well as on the possibility to generalize discourses, categories, and predicament of the U.S. ethnic-racial condition to other locations. This book, although not explicitly a comparative study, explores in detail how this process of becoming a racial-ethnic subject occurs, and in doing so elicits how in Brazil people, at some point of their life and under certain political conditions chose, as it were, to come out as *negro* (black) or *índio*, in locations where, up to a generation ago, other collective identities associated with class or the rural conditions would have been mobilized. Why is this happening? Has it to do with the new conditions created by Brazilian modernization? Or, more in detail, with new facilitating conditions offered by the changing legal context? Or a bit of both? French’s book is a painstakingly detailed account of the making of new ethnicities and of what in Brazil has been called “neocommunities” in rural Brazil, where both *índio*-ness and *negritude* are contested icons undergoing a process of re-signification—from onus to bonus, from liability to asset.

Throughout the book one reads of a universe in motion: agents, conditions, laws, and the self seem to have become more, as it were, ethnic prone. In the same place where one generation ago most community activists would have underplayed race or ethnicity, emphasizing community belonging of class solidarity, one now hears a different language. Has, however, the context changed as much as the language of the law and the laymen around it? This is, perhaps, the main question the book bears. French suggests that, in many ways, the ethnoracial condition, deep down, has changed less than the fashion it is now represented in writing, the law, legislation, and the jargon of social movement. Agents do change, however, do change dramatically. The book shows the rise and decline of the influence of the Catholic Church on these social movements. Priests, especially those related to the Liberation Theology movement, were great “ethnicizers,” making people become aware of ethnoracial injustice and promoting community formation also on the basis of ethnicity and the struggle against racial hierarchies. Generally speaking, trade unions and traditional community organizations and social movements, such as the black movement, in the region focused by the book—as well as in most of Brazil—have been losing grounds to new agents such NGOs, governmental agencies, and the new Pentecostal churches. I would add that with the advent of Lula in government many local leaders have entered, one way or another, the civil service. This is good, of course, but has often left a local vacuum.

The book also shows that the revival or reinvention of ethnic and racial identity is part of a broader revolution of rising expectation that includes labor relations, age and gender relations, and attitude to property. A good example is the trend to *meieros* (sharecropper) to *posseiros* (peasant-squatter) and, finally, to *quilombola* (descendants of maroon communities) (p. 91), which occur within a new universe of possibilities—wherein there is a general change of attitude of the federal government toward the land rights and status of *ndios* and *quilombola*. In this, popular and elite uses of the law show how much such law can generate a polyphony of meanings and practices, even when one compares two relatively similar and neighboring communities. In terms of civil rights, Brazil experiences of course a terrible backlog and the present progressive government has contributed to turn Brazil into, as it were, a Pandora's box: once claims to civil or land right succeeds somewhere more claims will crop up somewhere else. The *quilombo* status is now being claimed by a rapidly growing number of groups, now organized and speaking as (neo)communities. Having a distinguished culture “of your own,” and being able to perform it whenever needed, is part of such process. The process of patrimonialization of such distinguished cultural expressions by different sectional of the local and federal governments then cease to be just peculiar forms of popular culture to be turned into special expressions of ethnic identity. Multiculturalism might not have gained as yet the budget it needs to become effectively multicultural education but has certainly come to impregnate the representation of the nation (in posters, ads, leaflets, and even jargon of civil service). Alas, the dream of new land as well as civil rights spreads much more rapidly than the facilities and economic opportunities and resources that should support them.

The author stresses interestingly that this new process of recognition can be combined with the persistence—and even rejuvenation—of the popular cult of miscegenation (p. 101). So one can “become” black and in the meantime prize racial mixture (pp. 112–113). This, shows French, also takes place in the two communities studied among the new leaders who are literate, relatively well travelled, and well spoken (p. 160).

In the conclusion, French compares the two communities with the well-known cases of the Lumbee and Mashpee in the United States. Such comparison is seminal but ought to be expanded. The comparison shows anyhow that in Brazil a great generational shift is taking place: a new generation of leaders is coming of age in a context that is ethnicity prone rather than ethnophobic as in many ways was the case for their parents. It also shows that in the United States, much more than in Brazil, race and ethnicity are seen as coming before any intervention by the state, as something immanent.

Direct Action: An Ethnography. David Graeber. Edinburgh: AK Press, 2009. 568 pp.

RICHARD H. ROBBINS
SUNY at Plattsburgh

The aim of an ethnography, writes David Graeber, “is to try to give the reader the means to imaginatively pass inside a moral and social universe” (p. 510). In *Direct Action: An Ethnography*, Graeber continues his project, begun in *Toward an Anthropological Theory of Value* (2001), of imagining alternatives to capitalism. In this case it is an attempt, first, to model alternative forms of organization that are nonhierarchical and nonoppressive; second, to outline some strategies through which such an alternative can be realized; and, third, to correct a lack of understanding of how direct democracy works.

The book begins with a description of the planning by a coalition of activists in New York City of their role in the Summit of the Americas protest in Quebec City in April 2000. The idea being discussed is how to scale the 180-foot-high cliffs adjacent to the Plains of Abraham by activists clad in gloves, gas masks, yellow jumpsuits, helmets, and foam-rubber padding to present a petition to George Bush. Both the nature of the discussion and the absurdity of the plan (it was never attempted) capture both the freedom and the play of imagination characteristic of direct action. He then describes the actual protest, the battles with the police, the constantly shifting strategies of the protesters, the engagement with the mainstream and activist media, and the conversations with local citizens. As an activist, what you feel, says Graeber is “a sense of immediacy, fellowship, and spontaneity”; the sense of “exaltation, freedom, intersected by moments of rage, joy, panic, exhilaration, and despair”; and the experience of autonomy by occupying a space not under state control (pp. 190, 418).

Direct action, or anarchism itself, says Graeber, represents a way of engaging the world to bring about change in which the form of action, or its organization, is a model for the change one wishes to bring about. As he puts it,

it reflects very simple anarchist insight that one cannot create a free society through military discipline, a democratic society by giving orders, or happy one through joyless self-sacrifice. At its most elaborate, the structure of one's own act becomes a kind of micro-utopia, a concrete model for one's vision of free society. [p. 210]

Direct action answers the question of “What's the alternative?” by modeling an organizational structure that is truly democratic, and then engaging in actions that create for the activist participant a space, albeit temporary, in which

autonomy is experienced. The action itself is not directed at the state, nor is it necessarily a gesture of defiance. Instead, “one proceeds . . . as if the state does not exist” (p. 203).

As Graeber describes it, the planning of an action, the action, and the response of authorities ritually represent for activists and onlookers, a version of a less oppressive society while, at the same time, revealing the arbitrary state power that it is trying to replace. Thus, the inevitable violent actions of the police—attacks on peaceful protesters and innocent bystanders, on medics, along with the arbitrary infliction of pain and humiliation—confront the protesters with the reality of state power with all the pretence of benevolence stripped away. If arrested, says Graeber, and consequently under the power of the state, “one would seem to encounter both its brutality and its stupidity in unadulterated form” (p. 421).

Graeber provides a fascinating analysis of the role of the police, why they are essentially unaccountable for their actions, and why they sometimes react brutally. While many protesters are arrested during actions, very few ever come to trial. Consequently, as long as they don’t do permanent damage, the police are free to beat, detain, pepper spray, and maltreat demonstrators without fear of being held accountable in court.

The battle with the police involves determining who gets to define the terms of engagement. The typical protest narrative places the police in the role of maintaining order; yet inevitably in all the protests described by Graeber, the police start the violence. The standard story of the World Trade Organization (WTO) protest in Seattle in 1999, for example, is that some protesters began breaking windows and the police reacted with tear gas to disperse the crowd. In fact, the violence began when Secretary of State Madeline Albright called the governor to demand the police clear the peaceful protesters blocking the entrance to the conference. It was only after the violent actions of the police did any window breaking take place, a fact known to all media representatives at the time. Yet the narrative of police violence being only a reaction to violent behavior by the protesters persists.

Direct action most threatens power, he says, when it evidences a sense of imagination that model alternatives to the “stupid” power of bureaucracy that imposes arbitrary rules and backs them up with the most simple (and stupid) means of gaining assent—violence.

The book also discusses at length the problem of how to deal with the media and whether to ignore or engage them because they rarely tell a story that includes the reasons for the protest, instead treating the protests solely as a security issue. The emergence of independent media ensures, says Graeber, that at least one activist version of an action is represented.

The book is a major contribution to both ethnography and the attempts at building a new society inside the shell

of the old and countering critiques that claim that such a goal is unrealistic. To people’s reaction that the vision of a society without hierarchy is naïve and unrealistic, Graeber quotes Peter Kropotkin’s classic response: “What was naive and utopian was to believe that one could give someone arbitrary power over others and trust them to exercise it responsibly” (pp. 352–353).

If there is anything lacking in Graeber’s discussion it is a fuller consideration of the role of religion and spirituality in direct action. Direct action or, using Evens-Pritchard’s description of Nuer political organization, “ordered anarchy,” is modeled after the Zapatista rebellion in Chiapas that succeeded in largely neutralizing the military, and controlling their message through the new media. But direct action also contains elements of Quaker philosophy, and forms of decision-making characteristic of indigenous societies such as those in Madagascar described by Graeber in *Lost People: Magic and the Legacy of Slavery in Madagascar* (2007). The problem is that, other than forms of spirituality introduced largely by feminist groups, most direct action participants are non-religious. The problem then—one faced by most sectarian, alternative communities—is how do you maintain solidarity, particularly when personal autonomy is one of the primary aims of the group, without some form of spirituality? Graeber addresses the inevitable forms of “internalized oppression” evident in group members (pp. 129–130) and does allude to group consensus as “a ritual of sacrifice, the sacrifice of egoism,” but one wished that that thread was followed with more discussion.

References cited

- Graeber, David
 2001 *Toward an Anthropological Theory of Value: The False Coin of Our Own Dreams*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
 2007 *Lost People: Magic and the Legacy of Slavery in Madagascar*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

Faith in Schools: Religion, Education, and American Evangelicals in East Africa. Amy Stambach. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2010. 248 pp.

FRANCES JULIA RIEMER

Northern Arizona University

Anthropologists and Christian missionaries have shared a long history. They travel to similar places and occupy overlapping stages of the colonial enterprise. They share hardy personalities, indefatigable spirits, and, at times, even lodging. Margaret Meade, like many anthropologists before and afterward, boarded with missionaries during her research in Samoa. In my own work in Botswana, I have often found myself within hearing

distance of missionaries as they led bible study groups in the rented *rondovel* next to mine. Yet, as former missionary cum anthropologist Sjaak Van Der Geest wrote, the relationship between anthropologists and missionaries has been “ambivalent, uneasy, and fraught with contradictions” (1990:588). To quote Amy Stambach herself:

Historically, anthropologists and missionaries have held mutually negative attitudes even though the field of anthropology bears the legacy of missionaries’ ethnographic contributions. Missionaries have long maintained that anthropologists overlook the real and deeply held religious tents of adherents and favor instead analysis of (human, not godly) signification of religious meanings. Anthropologists have in turn regarded Christian evangelism as an instrument of conquest and subjugation, seeing missionaries’ work as unwittingly ethnocentric. [p. 18]

Stambach approaches that relationship in a novel manner in *Faith in Schools: Religion, Education, and American Evangelicals in East Africa*, her multisite ethnography of evangelical missionary involvement in Kenya, Tanzania, and Uganda. Like many anthropologists, Stambach first encountered the work of these nondenominational Christian groups while conducting her own fieldwork in East Africa. For this, her subsequent project, she set out to study “how and when religion and education are entwined” (p. 24) by casting an anthropological lens on her colleagues in the field, the missionaries themselves.

Stambach’s ethnographic examination of missionary practices takes a radial focus that is, in itself, innovative enough to make the text an important read. Her data collection moves, and moves us as readers, through space and across borders and boundaries. Stambach begins by introducing us to young American missionaries in the field. “Picture,” she tells us, “a Tanzanian public school in which American evangelical missionaries conducted fieldwork as part of their summer service work abroad” (p. 6). The white, middle-class college students to whom she introduces us were in Tanzania to meet their service learning requirements, which they did by teaching English to young locals. Stambach’s descriptions of their interactions, lessons taught in a school that can’t otherwise afford English instruction, are richly detailed. The portrayal is of well-meaning young Americans, singularly focused and unquestioning in their mission and their faith. While their official role is to offer English language instruction, conversion is the subtext for their work. They walk a thin line politically and socially in their attempts to accomplish both goals. As the group’s leader explained, “We *can’t* teach the New Testament, but we *can* use the Old Testament, since that won’t offend the Muslims” (p. 20).

Stambach then arcs back to the students’ mission training in Texas, where she attends nondenominational church

services, interviews instructors, and observes classes. In lectures, she hears faculty members draw on anthropology to facilitate social change, in other words, to modernize and Christianize the Africans with whom their students will work. While Stambach is clear that the missionaries’ anthropology “is not anthropology—that anthropology is more invoked than used in any rigorous way in nondenominational missiology,” she also argues that “anthropology for Christian witness is a language for framing missionary experience in the field” (p. 96). Completing the circuit, Stambach returns to the field to examine the ways East African Christians understand and negotiate their American colleagues. Rather than simply accepting their American counterparts with open arms, Stambach argues that local evangelists saw them as “points of contact.” Through these points, asserts Stambach, “they sought to leverage conversion and conduct their work” (p. 129). But these contact zones are also highly contested spaces—predicated on colonial histories, postcolonial nationalism, cultural understandings of morality, and what Stambach describes as autochthony, “the state of being indigenous and of owning or belonging to a place—used here in relation to questions about to whom the church belongs” (p. 133). Given the historical role of the missionary as advance guard for the colonial enterprise, the inclusion of beliefs about ownership and governance are central in an analysis of education, church, and missionary relationships in Africa. Stambach’s argument here is compelling—that a shared commitment to education does not preclude differences in what it means to be educated, or what it means to “claim Africa for Christ.”

The multisitedness of Stambach’s monograph provides a unique frame for a transnational analysis of the dialectical relationship of religion and education. Stambach contends that “location, despite all talk about transnationality, remains an important dimension of anthropology,” and the transcending of this local focus is indeed what makes her own work so intriguing. Stambach covers a great deal of ground—geographically, historically, and theoretically, and the text itself provides a long list of references for anyone interested in Christianity and education (and the anthropological framing of both) in east Africa. Even more, despite her self-disclosed initial “anti-missionary sentiment” (p. 28), Stambach is fair in her description and interrogation of these diverse and far-flung constituencies. The text, however, is not an easy read. Stambach’s anthropological theorizing is both dense and complex, and can at times feel plodding. That said, Stambach has identified a novel locus for the analysis of Christianity and education—young American missionaries, their U.S.-based training, and their service in three east African countries. The text will be of certain interest to fellow anthropologists, particularly those of us working in the field in Africa, as well as the very missiologists who draw

on anthropological concepts in the training of their young colleagues.

Reference cited

Van Der Geest, Sjaak
1990 Anthropologists and Missionaries: Brothers under the Skin.
Man 25(4):588–601.

Out in the Country: Youth, Media, and Queer Visibility in Rural America. *Mary Gray.* New York: New York University Press, 2009. 304 pp.

TANYA ERZEN

Ohio State University

In dominant representations of queer life, the rural is a space to be escaped for the refuge and freedom of the city. Yet the queer youth we encounter in *Out in the Country* do not necessarily yearn for the city but, rather, to expand their experiences of local belonging. Mary Gray's compelling ethnography describes how queer rural youth in Kentucky, Tennessee, and Indiana negotiate the politics of visibility and engage media in everyday life. They perform drag in the aisles of Wal-Mart, gather in the cafés of Christian bookstores, and agitate for Gay Straight Alliances (GSAs) in their high schools. Based on a mobile ethnography of various groups and organizations (she spent many hours driving from one rural town to another) and interviews with 34 youths, Gray argues that familiarity rather than visibility is the idiom for queer life in rural places. Queer youth and their political allies often lack the financial and geographic resources for sustained visibility, which is central to urban GLBT organizing. In their political work and social lives, they draw on the language of family for recognition because they live and work in places that prioritize solidarity and familiarity.

Gray vividly illustrates how visibility is negotiated through familiarity. Mary Bird, the mother of a lesbian daughter and a member of the Kentucky Homemakers Association, organizes an event to make her local community aware of the problems queer youth face. To garner support, Bird frames the event around "our children" and "our community." Another example of the politics of familiarity is a student's attempt to form a Gay Straight Alliance at a high school. The GSA is initially opposed by a mass student walkout and a subsequent ban of all school groups by the administration. The school administration later grudgingly approves the group after Fred Phelps and the notorious Westboro Baptist Church arrive in town to protest. Local pastors, students, parents, and residents, some of them initially resistant to the GSA, unite to rally against intolerant outsiders like Phelps. In her mesmerizing descriptions of these events, Gray illustrates how recognition and exclusion rest on the status of queer youth as familiar rather

than abhorrent strangers. At the rally and throughout the book, the queer youth also encounter Christianity in various guises: Mary Bird's event is disrupted by a Baptist pastor who wants to save sinners; Berea is an ecumenical Christian college; and Shaun, a member of a local GLBT group, formerly worked as a youth minister whose church attempted to cure him. What role do religious affiliations and religious spaces play in the politics of recognition and familiarity? The ways that religious affiliations relate to the politics of queer identity work is never addressed in the book.

Gray invokes the concept of "boundary publics" to describe how queer youth make up for their lack of numbers and a paucity of queer public spaces through "iterative, ephemeral experiences of belonging that circulate on the outskirts and through the center of more recognizable public spaces." Doing drag in Wal-Mart, performing queer punk music at a Methodist church-sponsored skate park and posting blogs online reveal the spatial dimension of queer identities, and how a public sense of queerness transpires in rural spaces. Gray writes, "the queer youth commandeer these spaces. They make do. They get by." Although the youth she meets creatively appropriate public spaces, violence in the form of harassment and hate mail still occur. Violence, Gray writes, is not experienced with greater frequency in rural places, but it is experienced more intimately. One young man explains that he knows who has the potential to beat him up and what places to avoid. This is a more sinister repercussion of rural familiarity.

Gray paraphrases Suzanne Walters that LGBT-identified people are perhaps better seen in the media but "not necessarily better known" (p. 30). The other central intervention of the book is Gray's analysis of the role of new media in the everyday lives of queer youth and what difference, if any, the internet makes to youth negotiating visibility in rural places. Employing an ethnography of media "in situ," Gray situates queer youths' media engagement within the broader terrain of social life. She employs the term *queer realness* to assess how coming-out narratives online enable two young men to enact a connection to a wider community of gays and affirm their identities and also how these online narratives can also be incommensurate with their own experiences. Gray suggests that queer identity work for youth is constructed in the politics of social interaction, and to examine how queer realness works, she relates how two rural trans-identifying youth make sense of the HBO documentary *What Sex Am I?* in light of their own trans desires. The pitfall of her adherence to this rigorous and productive form of media ethnography is that she only focuses on a few individuals, and we lack a sense of how media engagement works for most of the queer youth in the study.

Out in the Country's moving and rigorous depictions of rural queer youth as they negotiate visibility, familiarity, and media engagement is a major contribution to queer

theory, GLBT community studies, sexuality, and youth studies and ethnography. The book is all the more remarkable for the constraints placed on ethnographers researching issues around sexuality and youth. Gray's astute discussion of the politics of the institutional review board in relation to her project confirms why we are only beginning to learn more about young people's gender and sexual lives. She is insightful and forthright about why her interviewees and contacts tended to be queer, white young men, and why several young women dropped out of the study. She reflects that the lack of young women willing to participate indicates that they feel more isolated, shoulder more familial obligations, and have more at stake in being visible and recognized. Health care and public spaces for queer youth rather than visibility and marriage equality are urgent political questions for rural queer youth. In its innovative theorization of the limitations of visibility and the fallacy of urban-rural, online-offline, and visible-invisible dichotomies, this fascinating and important book not only disrupts our misconceptions and ignorance of queer rural lives, it also gestures toward all the political work and research yet to be done.

Making Their Place: Feminism after Socialism in Eastern Germany. Katja M. Guenther. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2010. 247 pp.

SARAH D. PHILLIPS

Indiana University, Bloomington

In *Making Their Place: Feminism after Socialism in Eastern Germany*, sociologist Katja M. Guenther undertakes an ethnographically informed analysis of patterns in relationships between place and social movements through a comparative analysis of postsocialist feminist movements in two cities in eastern Germany, Rostock and Erfert. Framing the study as a corrective to work in sociology that tends to focus primarily on the state to understand social movements, Guenther includes in her investigation cultural and historical components and discussions of scales of activity because "rather than operating in isolation, places are nested within complex networks that cut across scales" (p. 80). Specifically, Guenther focuses on three primary aspects of place that she argues shaped the feminist movements in the two cities: political forces (political climates and distributions of power), cultural forces (specific local histories and cultural repertoires), and spatial forces (geopolitical positioning and spatial alliances) (pp. 180–181).

This clear theoretical framework consistently drives the author's analysis, and the book also benefits from a rich narrative analysis based on participant-observation and 74 personal interviews conducted between 2000 and 2005. Each chapter is bookended by short, compelling ethno-

graphic vignettes that hint of the author's illuminating encounters in the field and leave the reader hungry for more such ethnographic detail. A helpful methodological appendix situates the study and the author's personal and scholarly interests in the topic.

By comparing how feminist groups in the cities of Rostock and Erfert—both in the former GDR, and with similar demographic characteristics—have fared in the years since German reunification, Guenther asks the question: "How can two feminist movements born out of the same historical transformation from socialism to democratic capitalism and sharing the same national context evolve so differently?" (p. 173). Indeed, whereas by 2009 the feminist movement in Rostock was robust, boasting a range of interconnected and financially healthy women's organizations, a powerful political lobby, and cooperative relationships with local and statewide officials, the movement in Erfert had low visibility and decreased capacity at all levels, with little public support and very limited funding. To understand these differences, which Guenther argues shed light on the importance of "the politics of making place" for social movement success, the author undertakes a detailed analysis of what she calls the "place character" of Rostock and Erfert in relation to feminist organizing. Guenther devotes two chapters to each of the cases, dividing the discussion into "Place and Politics in Rostock" (ch. 3), "Making Claims across Scale and Space in Rostock" (ch. 4), "Shutting Feminists Out of Erfert" (ch. 5), and "Making Claims across Scale and Space in Erfert" (ch. 6). Chapter 7 is a useful comparative summary of the two cases and the study's theoretical and policy implications.

Guenther attributes the relative success of feminist politics in Rostock to a specific place character that has proved amenable to feminist organizations on various levels. She shows that this has much to do with the left-leaning orientation of the state parliament and its governors as well as Rostock's feminists, who the author calls "neosocialist feminists." Guenther explains: "As practiced in Rostock, this ideology stresses women's economic dependence as the basis for gender inequality and values men as important actors in combating this inequality" (p. 175). This focus, Guenther argues, resonates with local norms and values. Rostock's feminist groups have formed strong organizations, "buil[t] an effective feminist policy machinery within the municipal government, and position[ed] themselves symbolically and discursively as part of the place of the city" (p. 69). Crucially, feminists in Rostock, who view the German state's approach to gender ideologies (which largely was inherited from the FRG after reunification and emphasizes the family and women's traditional family roles) as conservative, have "jumped scales" to more or less bypass the German national government. As detailed in chapter 4, Rostock's feminist leaders engage rather on the international level. First, as Rostock is

a port city on the Baltic Sea and is situated in the state of Mecklenburg–West Pomerania—which historically has a Baltic identity—feminists in Rostock look to colleagues in Scandinavia for cooperation. They also engage readily with EU gender policies, especially gender mainstreaming (the incorporation of a gender-equality perspective into all policies at all levels and stages), which dovetails nicely with these “neosocialist” feminists’ primary concern with women’s employment and economic empowerment. Other programs initiated by feminist groups in Rostock include shelters for battered women and girls, and rape crisis centers; these services address the problems of gender violence that Rostock’s feminists believe are by-products of women’s financial dependence. Guenther’s fine-grained excavation of Rostock’s place character shows how “local lenses in Rostock refilter the supranational agenda of the EU to align with local needs and frames” (p. 99).

In Erfert, by contrast, feminist groups have not been able to gain a strong foothold. This is despite the fact that Erfert was the birthplace of some of the most vibrant feminist organizations just after German reunification. The capital of Thuringia, historically one of Germany’s most conservative areas with high levels of religious identification, Erfert’s place character, argues Guenther, did not lend itself to feminist ideals. Unlike Rostock, whose population has some fondness for aspects of the GDR’s social policies, residents of Erfert tend to say that “Erfert was never meant to be communist” (p. 149) and are eager to lay the socialist past to rest. Guenther investigates Erfert’s place character as she details the city’s fractured feminist movement, which includes three competing ideologies (radical feminism, neosocialist feminism, and “conservative” [cultural] feminism) with minimal contact and cooperation between groups. Erfert’s feminists have no effective political lobby and during the last decade have lost influence at the municipal and state levels. In Erfert, feminist groups view the EU’s gender mainstreaming ideology with suspicion (Guenther believes many of them misunderstand the policy) and generally do not seek ties with other groups nationally or internationally. However, Erfert’s feminists do sometimes identify with and cooperate with cultural–conservative feminist groups in western Germany, another characteristic that differentiates them from feminists in Rostock.

Making Their Place will be of especial interest to scholars of social movements, feminist movements, post-socialism, and EU politics. The study resonates with anthropological studies that explore some of the unexpected features and consequences of the “transition” in Eastern Europe. Guenther’s detailed comparative work affirms that the socialist past matters, but it matters variously, even in places with a seemingly similar history. Importantly, the book supports the argument that to understand post-socialism it is crucial to take into account not only the legacies of state socialism; we must also interrogate the pres-

cialist histories of various locales. Especially interesting in Guenther’s analysis is her historical review of the pan-Baltic identity of Rostock, which has resulted in important cultural and practical linkages with Scandinavian countries.

The book also has significant policy relevance, especially as regards EU gender initiatives. In particular Guenther’s study of how feminist groups variously value and reject the EU’s gender mainstreaming policy is a useful case study of how a supranational policy can be variously understood, adopted, and adapted at different levels and by disparate groups. This information, if heeded, could prove useful for a more nuanced implementation of gender mainstreaming and other EU policies at national and local levels.

Making Their Place likely will motivate readers to revisit a long-asked question: Does socialism liberate women? The relative success of the feminist movement in left-leaning, “neosocialist” Rostock relative to the more “Western”-leaning Erfert, where even conservative–cultural feminism fails to resonate, certainly intrigues. A sustained consideration of this question—including a discussion of the rich established literature on postsocialist feminism—would have enhanced the book’s value for some readers. Additionally, some readers may wish that Guenther had broadened the perspective to focus less at times on the specific eastern German—or even postsocialist—context and more on the potential relevance of the rich case material she presents to other regions, contexts, and research questions. Overall, however, *Making Their Place* certainly satisfies as an insightful and well-written comparative study of how the differential development of “place character” shapes potentials for and forms of feminist organizing and is variously shaped by these efforts in turn.

Justice without Government: Bedouin Law from Sinai and the Negev. *Clinton Bailey.* New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2009. 375 pp., index.

SARAB ABU-RABIA-QUEDER

Ben-Gurion University

Justice without Government: Bedouin Law from Sinai and the Negev offers to analyze the Bedouin law system, its working mechanisms and logic by examining the link between the law and the culture from which it emerged. The data were gathered by the author through oral sources of questioning knowledgeable elderly Bedouin between 1991 and the present.

The book starts with a historical review of the emerging of Bedouin law in the Middle Eastern deserts and the meaning of justice among the Bedouin. Through different cases the author leads the reader to various fields of using the Bedouin legal system: in cases of violence between

individuals, collectives, and in matters that concern women and property.

This book offers a glimpse into the legal and judicial world of a population that is commonly considered to be a nomad-Bedouin group, whose lifestyle used to be predicated on a desert life. The desert ways not only dictated the social and gender norms on which Bedouins—even those who have adopted a sedentary way of life—rely to this very day, but they also gave rise to an elaborated and sophisticated system of law and justice, which has also endured to this day.

The book allows us to plunge into the world of desert law and the way in which the desert's inhabitants resolve disputes at various levels: between tribes, between women and men, between conjugal partners, between family members, and so forth. What is interesting, as Bailey points out, is that “the law enlists the raw materials of the culture—such as honor, might, violence, religious faith, and clan solidarity—in the service of justice” (p. 2). This is an immense contribution to understanding the structure of the tribal world, its interpersonal relations, the relations between the people and place, and their actions as a product of those relations.

The book's title implies that the Bedouin legal system is a just system, or at least one that aspires to show justice and equality for all. It is important to ask when this system is just and when it is discriminatory. What action can be taken to change or reform it? No less importantly, why does this system override all the other legal systems, for example, Israel's state law (in the case of the Bedouins in the Negev) and/or Muslim Sharia law? And what should happen in cases of conflict between them? How is the matter to be resolved when the all-powerful Bedouin law of the desert violates an individual's rights (e.g., in cases of polygamy or intratribal marriage), but religious law nevertheless allows it?

In certain cases the system of desert law, which is predicated on collective norms and values, can be prejudicial to the rights, autonomy, or justice of the individual. Usually, women are the most vulnerable population in Bedouin society. Examples of this can be found in the pressing issue of so-called honor killings—the murder of women to preserve family honor—and the polygamy issue. According to Israeli state law, polygamy is forbidden in the country. Under Islamic law, it is permitted only in certain circumstances. However, Bedouin society sanctions polygamous marriage, and women are not expected to put up any resistance to it, not by legal means either. The practice of polygamy in this case becomes a burden on women. The state does not enforce its laws among the Bedouins for reasons of cultural relativism, and, thus, women are the victims of the practice, being protected by neither state law nor the law of the desert. Different scholars have contended that this phenomenon must not be allowed to continue, and

that mechanisms must be efficiently employed to enforce Israeli state law and protect defenseless women, even if that constitutes harm to the law of the desert (Hassan 2001; Pirilla-Lapidot and Elhadad 2007).

In parallel to the danger of cultural relativism, there is a problem of insensitivity to intracultural issues, in the case of conflict between modern state organs such as the welfare system and tribal codes. Sometimes the state hastens to intervene in sensitive cases such as rape or incest using Western-based modes of treatment and, thus, may expose the victim to the risk of being murdered. Intervention by the police or by the legislature may not always be appropriate. The handling of such issues requires taking into account the codes and norms that make up the cultural fabric or turning to desert law and its systems—which sometimes better protect the victim than those of the state. In such cases, the norms and values of Bedouin society can be used to resolve the issue efficiently without endangering the victim (Bailey elaborates on this in ch. 6; see also Al-Krenawi and Graham 2001; Shalhoub-Kevorkian 1999).

A third conflict stemming from the primacy of desert law over Islamic religious law concerns the prohibition of marriage outside the permissible tribal boundaries (see Abu-Rabia-Queder 2007), and again its victims are the women of the elitist Bedouin families and the men of the fellahin Bedouin families who cannot marry each other. Bedouin laws permit marriage within defined tribal boundaries, sometimes even only within the clan (cousins of various degrees). In our modern world, where men and women no longer live as they used to live in the desert, among those who have settled in towns and who have turned to institutions of higher learning and employment, men and women from both sides of the tribal divide meet, mingle, and fall in love, and then wish to join hands in marriage, which is considered taboo by desert law. This has created a problem, which leaves many women spinsters and forces men to marry women outside Bedouin society. Islamic law, it should be noted, permits such marriages. The question, then, is: should desert law be followed? Or should it be resisted? And how can it be changed?

A unique contribution appears in chapter 6 in challenging the literature written to date and its depiction of the Bedouin woman as a victim in her society who has no rights. It is surprising to discover how simultaneously marginal and protected women's standing is. On the one hand, it is the woman who maintains the family honor; it is on her that the burden of childbearing and education and even of desert livelihood falls, making her contribution very important to the domestic economy and to raising the family. On the other hand, her honor is defended by a system of laws that make her untouchable, almost a saint. In cases of rape, for instance, as chapter 6 explains, the victim of sexual violence must prove her innocence through agreed signs

of resistance. The requirement of proof places her in a marginal position, for what if she had been unable to resist? What if there are no marks of resistance on her? However, contrary to contemporary belief, she will not be immediately murdered, for fathers defend their daughters who have been forcibly raped. This is the first time such information has appeared in a book about Bedouin society, for the literature to date has contended to the contrary: a violated woman invariably is murdered even if she has fallen victim to sexual violence.

The book is highly recommended to students and to researchers, and to welfare officials and educators who deal with Bedouin society, for understanding the web of relations between the sexes, between tribes, and between the people and place. The book's unique contribution lies in its reappraisal of cultural norms that can be applied in cases of conflict between modern systems and Bedouin society's codes.

References cited

- Abu-Rabia-Queder, Sarab
2007 Coping with "Forbidden Love" and Loveless Marriage: Educated Bedouin Women from the Negev. *Ethnography* 8(3):297–323.
- Al-Krenawi, A., and J. Graham
2001 The Cultural Mediator: Bridging the Gap between Non-Western Community and Professional Social Work Practice. *British Journal of Social Work* 31:665–685.
- Hassan, M.
2001 The Politics of Honor: Patriarchy, State and Women's Killing. *In Sex, Gender Politics*. D. Israeli et al., eds. Pp. 267–307. Tel-Aviv: Kv-Adum.
- Lapidot-Firilla, A., and R. Elhaddad
2007 Forbidden yet Practiced: Polygamy and Cyclical Making of Israeli Policy. Jerusalem: The Center for Strategic and Policy Studies.
- Shalhoub-Kevorkian, N.
1999 Issues and Dilemmas in Planning Policy and Research: The Israeli Palestinian Girl. *In Arab Children and Youth in Danger: From Existing Status to Future Planning*. K. Asbeh, ed. Pp. 89–101. Jerusalem: Brukdeil.

Airborn Dreams: "Nisei" Stewardesses and Pan American World Airways. *Christine Yano*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2011. 228 pp.

SAWA KUROTANI

University of Redlands

In this carefully crafted book, Christine Yano provides a compelling account of an emerging cosmopolitanism in the postwar "Jet Age." She brings together three "strands": the global strategy of Pan American World Airways, or Pan Am, young Japanese American women from Hawaii who were recruited as stewardesses, and the Jet Age. The outcome

is a complex interplay of gender, class, ethnicity, and race, as constructed through corporate ambitions, mobility practices, and consumer fantasies.

By the mid-1950s Pan Am established itself as the pioneer in commercial aviation and dominated international routes in and out of the United States. It also prided itself with its cosmopolitan image and sophisticated service, provided by highly trained "international" staff. As international travel and tourism in the Asia-Pacific region began to increase, Pan Am strategized to continue their dominance in the region by recruiting Japanese American women as stewardesses who would provide Japanese language service on board. Out of the "closed" hub in Honolulu, where only Japanese (American)—and, later, Asian (American)—stewardesses were based, they flew on transpacific and global routes, personified Pan Am's corporate identity, and appealed to the cosmopolitan aspirations of "jet-setters."

Called "Nisei" (second-generation Japanese American) regardless of their actual generational affiliation, these women demonstrated the work ethics, dedication, and personal conservatism of a "model minority" on the job. The fact that many of these women did not speak the language fluently was of little consequence; far more important to Pan Am and its customers was their exotic appearance and subservience. To Pan Am, the Asianness of "Nisei" stewardesses and the exceptional service that they provide added to the aura of cosmopolitanism and prestige that it had carefully cultivated, and as such they were a tool of "empire making." To the jet-setting crowd—largely white, American, upper class—that patronized Pan Am, their presence became an important part of their international travel experience, turning the airplane cabin into a hybrid, transitional space of comfort, privilege, and international flair. "Nisei" stewardesses' femininity and Japaneseness—Asianness were key elements of otherness; the servitude of the Asian-female other confirmed their Orientalist vision of the world and buttressed their dominant (read: "white-male") selves.

If Pan Am's airborne empire and rapidly expanding international travel and tourism were the macrostructural forces that dragged them out to the global stage, "Nisei" stewardesses seized the opportunity to cross their own ethnic and class boundaries and cultivate newly cosmopolitan identities. The majority of them came from largely ethnic, small-island communities, and many considered themselves "country girls." By "becoming Pan Am," they came into direct contact with the white elite culture for the first time; were exposed to the privileged lifestyle unimaginable in their own familial, ethnic, and class backgrounds; and enjoyed "proximal prestige," or an upward class mobility by proximity to a world-renowned corporation and to the wealthy and the powerful who traveled on its international flights.

"Becoming Pan Am" was not without cost, however. Japanese American "country girls" had to be turned into a corporate product through rigorous training, and the bodily discipline befitting of a Pan Am stewardess was enforced through constant surveillance. Many of their families also resisted the idea that their daughters were leaving the safety of the small, well-bounded community and becoming the "waitress" in the air. In other words, "Nisei" stewardesses gained access to prestige and their new selves only by going against their upbringing, submitting to corporate discipline, and consenting to the commodification of their femininity and Japanese-ness–Asianness.

Yet to ignore the agency of "Nisei" stewardesses in choosing their path is perhaps to reinforce the Orientalist fallacy of docile Asian women. While expressing appreciation of and close emotional connection to Pan Am, former "Nisei" stewardesses recount to Yano instances of resistance to corporate discipline, deliberate personal choices to limit their participation in the informal corporate culture that went against their own values, and learning to draw lines against belligerent passengers.

Three "strands" were, indeed, intertwined and interdependent. While Yano closely examines the drive for international mobility at the macro-, industrial level, it is through the lived experience of "Nisei" stewardesses as mobile subjects that her analysis of global frontiers and airborne cosmopolitanism come into focus. The realm of the intimate and the power of empires are inseparable, and as such, empires are as dependent on the individual subjects as individual subjects are on empire. Yano admirably resists the temptation to provide a black-and-white answer in the end and leaves the reader to mull over the complexity of intertwining forces and agencies that came together in this particular era. But one cannot help considering how the age of mass international travel led to Pan Am's eventual demise and how the innocent cosmopolitan dream of the Jet Age has been replaced by a somber realization of difference and domination. The only dream that lives on is that of "Nisei" stewardesses—who made the cosmopolitan aspirations their own and passed them on to others who came after them.

Yano's nuanced understanding of power and agency is grounded in the historical context of the Jet Age and the Japanese American experience. Attentive to the historical and cultural specifics, this richly informed account quickly opens up to the larger question of how gender, class, ethnicity, and race intersect in mobility practices. It is written in a highly accessible fashion without sacrificing the complexity of analysis and theoretical sophistication and will make an excellent text for a wide range of courses in anthropology, sociology, history, gender studies, race and ethnic studies, and global studies. A productive combination of interviews and archival research also promises to generate active discussion in qualitative method courses as well.

Itineraries in Conflict: Israelis, Palestinians, and the Politics of Tourism. *Rebecca Stein.* Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2008. 219 pp.

CHARLES HIRSCHKIND

University of California, Berkeley

Rebecca Stein's *Itineraries in Conflict: Israelis, Palestinians, and the Politics of Tourism* is a groundbreaking work in a number of regards. Anthropological scholarship on Israel–Palestine has tended to follow one of two lines of inquiry, either focusing on the brutalities of occupation and their toll on both those who enforce and those who suffer it or exploring how militarization finds expression within the cultural life of Israelis and Palestinians. Stein's work challenges such anthropological approaches to the conflict through an analysis that remains attentive to the ways that the boundaries between military action and cultural practices remain fluid, often producing a dynamic relation in which cultural forms become integral to strategies of colonial expansion and occupation. More specifically, she demonstrates how the spatial and representational practices of Israeli tourism have helped to secure forms of national identity consonant with the shifting goals and strategies of the Israeli state. I know of no other works on the Middle East that so powerfully demonstrate the interdependencies between popular cultural forms and strategies of political domination. Although Stein's approach owes a clear debt to Edward Said's seminal formulation of this relationship, her historically nuanced analysis allows us to understand culture not simply as a domain where domination secures its legitimacy but, rather, as a space of tactical reason.

Itineraries in Conflict examines how tourism has served as a site of ideological labor, first for the Zionist movement early in the 20th century and, subsequently, for projects of Israeli nationalism and colonialism, particularly during the post-Oslo period, from 1993 to 2000. As Stein argues, the series of accords begun in Oslo engendered a shift in Israel's relation both to neighboring Arab countries and to its own Palestinian Arab citizens, a shift that demanded a reformulation of the protocols and perceptual grids undergirding Israeli norms of self-recognition, what Stein calls "national intelligibility." Within this context, the figure of the tourist acquired a significance well beyond its socioeconomic importance: "Stories about tourism tried to stabilize the nation-state at this moment of geopolitical flux, to consolidate the borders around normative national culture even as Israel's territorial borders were becoming porous in new ways" (p. 21). As the second and third chapters of *Itineraries in Conflict* explore, tourism provided both the practical means and the narrative forms by which Palestinian areas of Israel were transformed from being sites of danger and enmity into arenas for the consumption of things

Arab—cultural practices, culinary specialties, local histories, and so on. Admittedly, this national reorientation gave Arab Israelis greater visibility within the Jewish polity. However, the terms of this new visibility—namely, that they perform their ethnic identity as tourist commodity, as object of consumer desire—had the effect, once again, of dispossessing them of their own agency and historical experience. The discourses of tourism, in other words, were one of the means by which Israel accommodated itself to its newly emerging proximity to the Arab world while, at the same time, consolidating a normative national culture emphasizing Israel's Jewish and European identity, and, thus, its civilizational difference from its Arab and Palestinian citizens and neighbors. As Stein persuasively argues, tourism, and the stories and images it circulated, helped regulate the norms of perceptual experience and memory that sustained Israel's evolving political geography.

A key virtue of Stein's analysis of Israeli political culture lies in her attentiveness to the tensions and fissures continuously produced around the discursive borders of national citizenship, not just by political events but, instead, by routine interactions between Israeli tourists and Palestinians that refuse the terms set by the dominant ideological frames. For example, despite the attempt to dispossess Palestinian Israelis of their experience of marginality and oppression by transforming them into objects of tourist consumption, the commodified cultural forms that Palestinians produced often maintained the ability to unsettle the norms of consumerist recognition. In the course of getting to know about the daily life and cares of Arabs, an increasing point of interest and delight for tourists during the mid-1990s, Israeli tourists at times would find themselves confronted with historical experiences of expulsion, expropriation, and discrimination. Such tensions are explored with considerable subtlety and ethnographic depth in the fourth chapter in which Stein describes the post-Oslo "culinary geography" that brought growing numbers of Israeli Jews to seek out "authentic" Palestinian Arab food in the Palestinian village of Abu Ghosh. These explorations of the instabilities and contradictions within the political field articulated by tourist practices and representations point to the contingency and mutability of what are often viewed as fixed political realities.

In the last chapter, Stein examines how the regional opening initiated by Oslo came to be reversed in the early 2000s as Israeli Jewish society, faced with a wave of Palestinian attacks on civilian targets, retreated to a national and subnational spatial imaginary. In the context of this "rescaling" process, the European-style coffee house emerged as a symbolic anchor for a new consolidation of Israeli national identity. Within Israeli newspaper and television coverage, the café became a privileged icon of Israel's new self-understanding, as an outpost of civilized European culture under attack by its non-European, uncivilized neighbors.

Stein writes: "As a place holder for the European nation-state, the café could also be marshaled to recast the conflict as a civilizational war. In this rendering, the Israeli occupation recedes from view" (p. 144). Here and throughout the book, Stein provides the reader with a powerful and insightful analysis of the cultural forms and practices through which a shifting geographic imaginary comes to be instantiated within Israeli public life. This is a work of exceptional merit and deserves to be widely read.

The Tourism Encounter: Fashioning Latin American Nations and Histories. *Florence E. Babb.* Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2011. 264 pp.

NOEL B. SALAZAR

University of Leuven

In *The Tourism Encounter*, Florence Babb uses tourism as an analytical lens for considering shifting relations of culture and power that emerge in transitional societies marked by conflict or resolution. Her main thesis is that tourism in postrevolutionary nations (Cuba and Nicaragua) and post-conflict "hot spots" (Chiapas in Mexico and Andean Peru) acts as a major agent not only for economic recovery and political stability but also for the refashioning of interpretations of the past (i.e., cultural heritage) and desires for the future (i.e., national identity). Babb argues that tourism, as a trade in nostalgia for either revolution or cultural heritage, "often takes up where social transformation leaves off and even benefits from the formerly off-limits status of nations that have undergone periods of conflict or rebellion" (p. 2).

In modern-day Cuba, cultural tourism both undermines and supports one of the last bastions of socialism. On the one hand, there are the constantly recycled notions of revolution, best symbolized by the iconic presence of Che Guevara throughout the tourism circuit. On the other hand, vintage American cars and the legacy of Ernest Hemingway in the streets of old Havana mark the type of commoditized heritage tourism that is nostalgic for prerevolutionary (capitalist-identified) extravagance verging on decadence. Babb suggests that these two faces of tourism are not always separable as they are "two versions of the same nostalgia" (p. 30). Thus, tourism both saves the fading revolution from collapse and acts as a compelling catalyst for social and political change (through the increased engagement with the global market economy).

Nicaragua has had a real makeover since its revolutionary period (1979–90), a change that is nicely reflected in its tourism business. While the 1980s attracted mainly *sandalistas*, "political tourists" from the West showing their support for the Sandinista government, present-day tourism heavily romanticizes the revolution, turning the mainstream outside image of Nicaragua from "dangerous" into "different." Following the dictates of the global experience

economy, this Central American nation now represents itself in various ways to different potential tourism market segments. At the same time, Nicaraguan culture is depicted in rather homogenized ways (e.g., with little marketing of local crafts and other products). As has been documented in other parts of the world (Bruner 2005; Salazar 2010), such cultural tourism imaginaries both frame and are framed by how local people view and construct their identities.

The violence caused in the 1980s by Sendero Luminoso (Shining Path) in the Peruvian highlands seems to have been totally erased in tourism products and practices. Instead, ethnic tourism capitalizes on the globally circulating imaginaries of Inca history as well as present-day cultural life. The tourists' nostalgic longing for experiences of the "living past" is met by sanitized displays and performances of cultural heritage in popular destinations like Cuzco. Thus, in contrast with Cuba and Nicaragua, "in Peru tourism builds on past dreams of modernization and hopes of recovery from violent memory and economic need" (p. 91).

In Chiapas, Mexico, however, "that what had stalled tourism has also brought it back" (p. 105). The romantic appeal of the indigenous Zapatista revolutionary movement has helped to drive both solidarity and mainstream travel in the region. The Zapatistas may have had major issues with their country signing NAFTA, they rarely targeted tourism. In fact, Subcomandante Marcos is said to have called out to a group of foreign tourists, "We apologize for the inconvenience, but this is a revolution" (p. 97). Moreover, as in the case of Cuba and Nicaragua, the movement benefitted from international solidarity tourism. As Babb rightly remarks, the fact that Chiapas was off-limits for mainstream tourism and thus protected from overexposure, made the region much more attractive for visitors after the uprising.

The last part of *The Tourism Encounter* zooms in on the troubled relationship between tourism and issues of race, class, and gender. The discussion of sex tourism in Cuba and Nicaragua serves to "illuminate the particular challenges that more marginalized sectors confront in the tourism development process" (p. 123). Indeed, the mix of tourism with sex, romance, and politics in both nations is difficult and ambivalent. In Andean Peru and Chiapas, the cultural tourism encounter is highly gendered and racialized. Indigenous women, aware of their global image as "authentic" repositories of cultural tradition, "play a part in making the nation by becoming stakeholders in their own identity construction" (p. 154). These tourism stakeholders demonstrate high levels of creativity in marketing and selling both their cultural heritage and indigenous identities to rapidly changing tourist preferences.

Babb's elaborated analyses are punctuated by vivid ethnographic narratives, creating a rich understanding of cultural tourism in Latin America and its deployment in re-fashioning national identities and promoting highly selec-

tive histories. It would have been nice to read a little more about the "eclectic" (p. 14) ethnographic methods she used in this complex comparative research. And how can the "post-tourists" drawn to postrevolutionary and postconflict tourism be characterized? Although outside the scope of the book, I would be interested in knowing how the described dynamic processes play out in the context of mainstream tourism for both international and domestic visitors in the countries under study.

In summary, *The Tourism Encounter* is a very well-written monograph that provides four empirical examples of how the adaptation of tourism in transitional societies "may contribute to furthering not only postconflict stabilization and economic transformation but decolonizing projects that challenge imbalances of power by race, class, gender, and nationality" (p. 189). Being both readable and conceptually rich, this book would complement both advanced undergraduate and graduate seminars. It will certainly be of interest to scholars in anthropology, Latin American studies, tourism studies, and gender studies. The book should be considered essential reading for those interested in contemporary tourism in general, as it provides a unique comparative perspective, with implications that extend far beyond the Latin American region.

References cited

- Bruner, Edward M.
2005 *Culture on Tour: Ethnographies of Travel*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Salazar, Noel B.
2010 *Envisioning Eden: Mobilizing Imaginaries in Tourism and Beyond*. Oxford: Berghahn.

The Moral Resonance of Arab Media: Audio-Cassette Poetry and Culture in Yemen. *Flagg Miller*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard Center for Middle Eastern Studies, 2007. 525 pp., endnotes, appendices.

DOROTHEA E. SCHULZ

University of Cologne

In his theoretically complex and carefully illustrated study of *The Moral Resonance of Arab Media: Audio-Cassette Poetry and Culture in Yemen*, Flagg Miller addresses a set of timely questions: How do Yemeni poets succeed in making their poetry speak to the contemporary political aspirations, everyday concerns, and aesthetic expectations of their listeners? Where do they draw on long-standing conventions of verbal virtuosity to do so, and where might one discern departures from earlier rhetorical forms? In what sense do the new conditions created by a mass-mediated consumer culture affect the rhetorical and moral authority of the poets? On what changing forms of social subjectivity do these transformations reflect?

In response to these questions, Miller combines his account of the changing parameters of oral poetry and of its modes of appropriation and appreciation with theoretically sophisticated reflections that make the book speak to very diverse bodies of scholarship drawn from different disciplines and subdisciplines, among them linguistic anthropology; media studies; new work on the public sphere, popular culture, religion, and media; and the anthropology of the state.

Miller proposes an at once synchronic and diachronic perspective to account for the ongoing aesthetic and political relevancy of oral poetry to audiences in the tribal regions of southern Yemen. For this, Miller focuses on one particular locale and a specific set of actors, the town Yafi', and its (male) poets and singers whose oral poetry is currently circulating in audio-recorded form.

Miller retraces transformations and continuities in the appreciation of audio-recorded oral poetry by examining them through different analytical lenses: by exploring the moral effects listeners attribute to visual and aural as complementary forms of aesthetic mediation, and to the various ways of recombining the oral, the visual, and the graphic as modes of generating pleasurable poetic expression.

Following an appraisal of the appeal of oral poetry prior to the emergence of a lively audio-recording and broadcasting industry (ch. 2), Miller identifies important changes in the social and political conditions for consuming and appreciating audio-recorded poetry. Among these new conditions are mass education and the considerable mobility of rural Yemenis whose movement back and forth between town and home village make it difficult to draw clear-cut boundaries between distinct genres of oral poetry. Tribal poets continue to appeal to the aesthetic expectations of various audiences by generating a new, composite style that Flag labels "metropolitan tribalism" and identifies as a form of political discourse. This style incorporates various stylistic influences and ideologies, among them radical Islam, socialism and a rhetoric of nationalism, and nationalist rhetoric, and makes innovative use of audio-recording technology.

Chapter 2 is also devoted to a close examination of a genre of audiotaped poetry that is based on a dialogic exchange between two oral artists: the *bid' wa jiwāb qasīdah*. As Miller demonstrates, the dialogic structure of this genre draws on old-standing conventions of written exchange between representatives of the religious and political elite. Miller's reconstruction of these historical roots of contemporary audio recorded poetry are of considerable theoretical import. He shows in fascinating detail how stylistic conventions associated with writing are presupposed and integrated into oral presentational forms. Miller thereby innovatively contributes to scholarship in media studies and anthropology that emphasizes the intertwining and mutual dependence of writing and speaking and, thus, departs

from earlier, schematic accounts of the practices as distinct, opposed, and mutually exclusive.

In subsequent chapters (chs. 4–6), Miller convincingly demonstrates how oral poets and those who fervently listen to their audio-recorded performances conceive of writing as an integral—often implicit—element of oral art. Performers and audiences attribute certain moral effects and "resonances" with the sensuously mediated, aesthetic qualities of oral poetry and of their mass-mediated reproductions. Here again, Miller breaks new ground by demonstrating the complex sensory, aesthetic, and ethical ramifications generated by the media use and engagements of poets and their audiences. For this, he analyzes practices of—seemingly spontaneous—oral composition, the different elements and stylistic conventions on which poets draw during this process, and also the broader social and political setting within which oral poetry is received and given meaning as a critical reflection on politics and the status quo of society. Miller also convincingly illustrates that notions of "character," credibility, and reputation play a central role in turning the cassette *qasīdah* into an important genre through which the public persona and moral credibility of the performer is asserted and authenticated.

However, it is also at this point that one shortcoming of Miller's study comes to the fore. Although he aims to demonstrate the deep ethical and aesthetic resonances of cassette oral poetry in Yemeni society, he offers little detail on the ways in which diverse groups of listeners incorporate their media engagements into their daily doings and concerns. In this respect, it would have been useful to move beyond a focus on the formal, structural characteristics of the *qasīdah* and on the oral artists and their practices of poetic composition. Because of this lack of social and political contextualization, Miller's account sometimes appears overly abstract and withdrawn from the complex, and possibly contradictory, contours of everyday life.

Some of the qualities that account for the strength of the book, such as the rich empirical material on which it is based and its extensive theoretical reflections, could also be taken as some of the book's drawbacks. Its length (525 pages, including comprehensive endnotes and appendices with translated and some transliterated poems) and argumentative complexity do not make it an easy read for newcomers to the fields of linguistic anthropology, media studies, or Arabic literature. Also, Miller's dense prose and richly layered argumentative style sometimes make it difficult to follow his line of reasoning. This is unfortunate because theoretically sophisticated ethnographies of the compelling aesthetic forces of Arab oral arts such as the one offered by Miller are very much needed in a situation in which anything remotely reminiscent of the audio-recorded self-presentations of Muslim religious leaders is suspect of association with global "Arab" terrorism.

In spite of these drawbacks, Flagg Miller's study presents a highly original and in many respects convincingly demonstrated ethnography of the compelling force of the oral and aural in contemporary southern Yemeni society, and of how particular media technologies at once presuppose and generate communities based on shared aesthetic appreciation.

City of Strangers: Gulf Migration and the Indian Community in Bahrain. Andrew M. Gardner. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2010. xi + 188 pp.

AHMED KANNA

University of the Pacific

To the field of Arab Gulf studies, with its tendency to proceed from an unquestioning positivism and to eschew theory, Andrew Gardner's *City of Strangers* is a welcome contribution. It is elegantly written and theoretically suggestive, conversing in productive ways with important questions of transnationalism, the public sphere, and the commodification of migrant labor. At its strongest, *City of Strangers* conjures intriguing theoretical connections, thus perhaps indicating that the Gulf region's long consignment to the peripheries of the social sciences might be coming to an end.

Gardner applies the concept of "structural violence," derived from the work of Eric Wolf and William Roseberry, to the case of Bahrain, in many ways a typical country of the Arab Gulf, in which the discovery and export of oil led to the rise of an extremely multinational society to which huge numbers of foreigners, primarily South Asians, came to labor. The book is, more or less, a description of the ways that the Bahraini state, in complicity with its citizens, has nervously tried to contain the "foreign matter" represented by South Asians, imagined as invasive and culturally corrosive of indigenous Bahraini culture.

Gardner's sketches of the experiences of differently situated Indians in Bahrain are concise and powerful. The case of Vijay, a migrant and former tailor from Pondicherry, is illustrative of what Gardner calls the "transnational proletariat," a group particularly vulnerable to sudden and arbitrary illegalization. Because his boss refused both to pay him and to return his confiscated passport, Vijay became an "illegal worker." This illegalization made Vijay's sojourn in Bahrain—after an arduous process in which his family took on enormous debt to finance his migration—futile. Vijay can only hope to save enough money to go back to India. This is a disastrous outcome because, as Gardner contextualizes well, "the individual laborer is deeply enmeshed in a complex web of household relations and dependencies . . . most of the men I encountered clearly articulated that the fate of an extended family hangs in the balance" (p. 61). Gardner's analysis of the transnational pro-

letariat, with its emphasis on the structural dimensions of migrant labor in the Gulf, is a much-needed corrective to prevailing rational choice framings of Gulf migration.

Moreover, as exemplified by the chapter on the Indian "diasporic elite" and their "strategic transnationalism," Gardner is an anthropologist with both a keen eye for details that reveal important larger points, and a powerful concision in articulating such lessons. His discussion of social clubs and English language newspapers (chs. 5 and 6, respectively), engages Habermas's concept of the "public sphere" and sketches the outlines of future research: What does the notion of a public sphere mean when both the public and class are as fragmented as they are in the modern Gulf? Also fascinating are the examples of "strategic transnationalism" among more well-to-do South Asian expatriates, who see Bahrain as a place in which to secure a better life than is available in India but who are fully aware of the uncertainty of their position in the Gulf. These more well-situated foreigners respond to the situation by keeping houses, capital, or other connections to locales further afield (India, but also other parts of the former British Empire in Africa, the Middle East, and North America). Here, Gardner suggests that there is great potential in ethnographic material from the Gulf to build on other work from the Asian arena, specifically that of Aihwa Ong on Chinese diasporic business networks. Unlike Ong's notion of "flexible citizenship," Gardner argues that "strategic transnationalism" downplays the centrality of citizenship in a diaspora's calculations, implying that western Indian Ocean circuits can be a source of new theory on migration and transnationalism.

One wishes that Gardner would have devoted more of his observational and analytical powers to a thicker description, and perhaps a genealogical analysis, of what Anh Nga Longva has called the Gulf's ethnocratic politics. The reader is left with a somewhat monolithic picture of Bahrainis as a dominant ethne and beneficiaries of the state's system of discrimination against foreigners, based on the *kafala* or foreign employee sponsorship system. Bahrainis are often described as feeling entitled to welfare state distributive goods and as abusive of the privileged position into which they are placed vis-à-vis (especially South Asian) foreigners. While Gardner does briefly discuss systematic Sunni-Shi'a hierarchies and, thus, does imply that Bahrainis are not a homogeneous group, he could have better contextualized the relationship between ethnocracy and the making of the modern Bahraini state. For much of the past century, and not least in recent months, Bahrain has been one of the Arab Gulf's hotbeds of citizen agitation against arbitrary state power through ethnic and sectarian discrimination. The making of Bahraini ethnocracy was never uncontested, and although Gardner does not argue otherwise, the picture of a Bahraini citizenry as a generalized subject of a Bahraini state primarily concerned with containing

“foreign matter” risks homogenizing the process through which modern Bahrain was made in indigenous social negotiation and conflict (there is a similar risk of homogenization in representing South Asians as a generalized subaltern of the kafala system).

I was particularly intrigued with Gardner’s insight that foreign workers are part of a complex “deportation industry” (p. 68) that involves not only police and immigration officials but also all kinds of other agents (airline executives, pilots, etc.). Although Gardner does not elaborate on this, my feeling is that this is both a correct intuition and a richly suggestive avenue of future research. One hopes that Gardner continues to pursue this thread in his future work—it would make for a major contribution to Middle Eastern ethnography. It is because of such moments of insight that *City of Strangers* is a valuable contribution, well worth a close reading. It should be on the reading list of any social scientist with an interest in the region.

A Return to Servitude: Maya Migration and the Tourist Trade in Cancún. M. Bianet Castellanos. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2010. xliii + 182 pp.

RONDA L. BRULOTTE

University of New Mexico

Over the past two decades, tourism and migration both have received increasing attention within Mexican studies. This is not surprising given that the global tourism industry and migration remittances, along with oil revenues, are among the top sources of Mexico’s economic wealth. Yet while anthropologists have significantly contributed to the substantial literatures documenting these two phenomena, M. Bianet Castellanos makes a very convincing case for why we should pay more attention to the relationship between them. This fine-grained ethnography, the product of 15 years of field work in the Yucatán Peninsula, provides a rich analysis of the social and economic transformations experienced by rural Maya migrants who have long served as the labor backbone of Cancún’s luxury resort industry.

In the late 1960s, Mexican state planners famously identified the coastal area today known as the city of Cancún (located in the state of Quintana Roo) as the ideal site for tourism development. Castellanos describes how the region went from consisting of two sparsely populated villages in 1969, Puerto Juárez (pop. 117) and Kan Kún (pop. 3), to becoming a bustling sand-and-sea tourist destination within a decade (p. 82). Initially, the megaresort model of development created a large-scale demand for skilled service and construction laborers; workers from all over Mexico flocked to the region, but the promise of lucrative wage-work also attracted migrants from the rural countryside, many of whom are indigenous Maya. Today, one-

third of the city’s population is made up of Maya migrants (p. xviii). Through the case study of Kuchmil (pseudonym), a rural, indigenous Maya community outside the urban center of Valladolid, the author illustrates this population’s history of migration and participation in Cancún’s rapidly expanding tourism economy.

The book opens with the author and a young woman from Kuchmil attempting to locate the latter’s two brothers who worked in Cancún and resided in one of the numerous shantytowns housing its migrant workforce. The unpaved roads, the lack of street signs and distinctive landmarks, and the transient nature of its residents prove disorienting as the women try to navigate the unfamiliar terrain. This vignette evokes another, deeper sense of dislocation: the ghostly existence of the migrants themselves as they move between the world of the village and Cancún. The author offers phantoms and their haunting presence as a framing device, arguing that phantoms are useful because they “draw attention to cultural practices and histories that have been denied, suppressed, or erased by modernity’s violence” (p. xxi). The rest of the introduction lays out the author’s theoretical and methodological framework for understanding Maya peoples’ integration into processes of modernity and globalization, touching on the complexities of Maya identity, the creation of Cancún as free-trade zone, and the impetus for internal migration, among other issues.

In chapter 1, the author broadly traces the history of two Kuchmil families, illustrating the economic hardships of agrarian life and the conditions underpinning the creation of the Kuchmil–Cancún migrant circuit. Chapters 2 and 3 expand on these themes by examining the history of the Yucatán vis-à-vis government control over land tenure and state-led programs whose aim was to “modernize” indigenous populations through cultural missions and public education. The cumulative effect of this history was the formation of a rural labor force that could be readily harnessed by demands of capital as Cancún exploded into a free-trade, international tourist zone. In chapter 4, the reader is transported to Cancún, where the author describes the discursive and structural means by which Maya migrants become modern, service-sector workers. The disciplining of new workers also entails a transformation of their consumption habits, and chapter 5 closely examines the social networks implicated in the new economy of migrant goods and tastes, as they correlate with gender norms and expectations. Chapter 6 describes how Maya concepts of “personhood” and “social obligations” are frequently at odds with the narrative of progress epitomized by Cancún’s resort-model development, and, critically, how migrants challenge capitalism’s inequities by becoming *chingón/a*, a term in Mexican Spanish that here refers to becoming astute and/or aggressive, in managing one’s affairs. A final chapter exposes the fragility of international tourism as a model of

development by looking at the wide-scale suffering of migrant residents in wake of Hurricane Wilma in 2005.

My only caution is that readers hoping for a discussion of the interaction between Maya workers and tourists may be disappointed. The author anticipates this critique and justifies the omission, explaining that only specific workers are allowed to engage with tourists (e.g., bartenders and restaurant wait staff), and, even then, the demanding nature of the work itself leaves little time for socializing or forging true friendships with visitors. She writes, "Therefore, these displays of friendship are just that, displays. For these reasons, few tourist encounters are included in this book" (p. 96). While it is undoubtedly difficult for service workers to engage in deep, meaningful relationships with tourists, omitting these exchanges altogether seems something of a missed opportunity, particularly when there exists such a rich tradition in tourism studies of examining performativity, representation, and display. One wonders what perceptions Maya workers had of tourists (and vice versa), and how these exchanges, however limited in scope, opened up spaces where new forms of personhood and consumption became visible.

One of the things I appreciated most about *A Return to Servitude* is how skillfully it integrates classic themes in ethnography—kinship, household economic organization, indigenous communities, gender roles—with the most recent scholarship on state-led development agendas, transnational tourism, and rural–urban migration. The text's theoretical arguments regarding modernity and the reconfiguration of social life under Mexico's neoliberal reforms will prove insightful to advanced scholars and graduate students in anthropology, Latin American studies, and Native studies. Yet the book's main arguments will not be lost on undergraduate readers, and the author's clear, engaging prose and attention to ethnographic detail make this an ideal text for classroom teaching.

Transnational Families, Migration, and Gender: Moroccan and Filipino Women in Bologna and Barcelona. *Elisabetta Zontini*. New York: Berghahn, 2010. 280 pp.

CATI COE

Rutgers University, Camden

Women are on the move, as specific labor opportunities open up for them in globally restructured economies. As middle-class women work outside the home and social inequality widens in postindustrial countries, households increasingly purchase domestic services, whether in the form of prepared food, cleaning and gardening services, or personal care. Some of these services are provided by an informal and poorly regulated market, allowing immigrants without work authorization to find employment and middle-class households to afford these

services. Immigrant women are central to particular service niches, becoming nannies in New York City (as illustrated by Tamara Mose Brown's *Raising Brooklyn*, 2011), maids in Hong Kong (as in Nicole Constable's *Maid to Order in Hong Kong*, 1997), and live-in home health aides for the elderly in the United States (as among the Ghanaians I know). *Transnational Families, Migration, and Gender* illustrates this global phenomenon through ethnographic work among Moroccan and Filipino women in Bologna, Italy, and Barcelona, Spain. These women find themselves working as domestic servants, despite their education and aspirations, because other parts of the local labor market remain closed to them. Because domestic service requires emotional labor and long hours yet is so poorly compensated, it can be difficult for migrant domestic workers to maintain their own households, except transnationally, across borders.

As *Transnational Families, Migration, and Gender* shows, women's experiences of such work vary, however. Ethnic stereotyping in the local labor market as well as expectations about women's roles in production and reproduction strongly affect women's degree of satisfaction with their work. Filipinas spoke contentedly about domestic service to Zontini, in the main, despite the fact that it represents a downgrading from their prior middle-class employment in the Philippines. They were expected to work, in the Philippines as well as abroad, and their status increased with their migration and remittances to families. Because of the difficulties of combining domestic work with raising children, Filipinas often sent back or left their children in the Philippines, remitting much of their income to support their children's schooling. Long-distance marriages and parenting were widely accepted, even though children and couples might privately suffer, particularly when they reunited. Filipinas were favored in the domestic service market in both Bologna and Barcelona (unlike in Hong Kong), commanding the higher end of the salary range and more formal contracts. Thus, they could move relatively quickly from more onerous live-in work to live-out domestic service, where they had more privacy and control over their time. Because of the significance of their reputation, Filipina domestic workers contributed to their ethnic stereotyping as good workers, which community surveillance through the Filipino Catholic Church and other associations also encouraged.

Moroccan women, in contrast, were stigmatized in the domestic service market and, thus, had difficulty getting formal contracts and acceptable pay. They preferred to be supported by their spouses, as they would anticipate in Morocco, although they found that in Spain or Italy, with its higher costs of living, they need to work to meet household expenses. They expected to live with their children, although the difficulties of combining work with childcare meant that some sent their young children to Morocco to live with grandparents for a year or two. The

shorter distance between Southern Europe and Morocco also meant that visits to children were easier and more frequent in Moroccan families, resulting in more contact and closer parent-child relationships than Zontini saw in Filipino families. Given the women's experience of domestic service in Morocco, they associated it with degrading class positions.

As a result of their poor position in the labor market, the stigma of domestic service, and their vision of their own domestic households, Moroccan women were less likely to see the exchange offered by domestic service employment as favorable and quickly quit exploitative or poorly paid jobs. While many of the Filipinas Zontini interviewed were fully employed, the Moroccan women were more likely to be engaged in hourly or part-time domestic service that allowed them to keep up their domestic role in their own households. They sent smaller remittances home than Filipinas, not only because they, as daughters and sisters, were not expected to contribute financially but also because their economic position in the country of migration was so precarious. Despite women's similar segregation in the domestic service market, the way that Moroccans and Filipinas organized their employment and households were the result of the differential possibilities offered by the local labor market combined with women's expectations of family life.

Zontini makes several contributions to the literature on women and migration that has been growing since the mid-1990s. Although Filipinas are associated with women's "independent" migration and Moroccans with a migration led by men followed by dependent wives and children, such distinctions about autonomous and dependent migrants do not make sense of these women's migration trajectories, nor of those of men and children, for that matter. Even women who migrate alone are supported by their families and friends, and women who reunite with their husbands abroad may have finagled their way through many obstacles, whether legal barriers or in-law objections, to join them. Women's agency was often exercised through the role of dutiful daughter or the construction of migration as a family project. Zontini also highlights the interrelationship between women's employment and their role in their families. Unlike some studies that have shown that women's lives improve after their migration because of their greater economic participation (and power in the household), Zontini presents a more complex picture in which women's labor participation either did not increase dramatically after migration or was fraught with tensions. All in all, this book provides a useful introduction to the European literature on this topic and an interesting case study of an important phenomenon.

References cited

Brown, Tamara Mose
2011 *Raising Brooklyn*. New York: New York University Press.

Constable, Nicole
1997 *Maid to Order in Hong Kong*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press.

Falling into the Lesbi World: Desire and Difference in Indonesia. Evelyn Blackwood. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2010. ix + 251 pp.

ROBERT F. PHILLIPS

St. Francis Xavier University

With *Falling into the Lesbi World: Desire and Difference in Indonesia*, Evelyn Blackwood uses the day-to-day lives of "tombois" and their girlfriends in the metropolis of Padang, West Sumatra, as a lens through which to create an absorbing study of sexual and gender difference. Drawing on rich and varied bodies of scholarship and well-crafted ethnographic descriptions, Blackwood produces a noteworthy work that demonstrates how the same-sex Indonesian couples at the center of her research negotiate transgressive identities and desires.

Blackwood's book is based mainly on fieldwork conducted in 2001 and 2004 among *lesbi*. This Indonesian term, which is derived from the English word *lesbian*, has a meaning that is contingent on who is using it. In many situations it is used interchangeably with its cognate, but as the author explains, she is using *lesbi* in contradistinction to *lesbian* to make clear that while "lesbian" is a term that represents a stable, autonomous identity, *lesbi* is much more fluid and dynamic. As such, while the *lesbi* that Blackwood interviewed classified themselves as *lesbi*, they nonetheless preferred to use more specific gender-marked terms. Thus, the analytical focus on "tombois," masculine females who identify as men and desire women and "femme" girlfriends, who view themselves as normal women who desire men. The author employed a variety of ethnographic methods with the *lesbi* in Padang including participant-observation, formal interviews, and the taking of detailed life histories. During this same period, she also drew on information gathered at informal discussions and meetings with members and leaders of *lesbi* activist groups in Jakarta. The book also benefits greatly from the author's inclusion of her own experiences with *lesbi*, which began in West Sumatra in 1990 while she was conducting dissertation research.

The author begins the text with a comprehensive introductory chapter aptly titled "Gender, Sexuality, and Queer Desire," in which she contextualizes her research and subsequently outlines the theoretical framework. While Blackwood deftly covers such topics as geography, ethnicity, and citizenship in contemporary Indonesia, her writing shines during two of the longer sections of the chapter. The first, dealing with globalizing sexualities, details her reasons for utilizing a transnational queer feminist approach to her

topic. In the process, Blackwood sets the stage for later sections of the book in which she outlines how the lives of the lesbi who are the subject of her study challenge global LGBT identity discourse and, in turn, highlight the contingency of such identities. Second, she delineates her particular framing of self, subjectivity, and gender. Through a concise discussion in which the author explains why she uses the language of subjects and subjectivity rather than identity, Blackwood elegantly introduces the reader to her conceptualization of the processual nature of tomboi and femme selves and how these subjectivities are created and mediated over time. It is here that she spells out and contextualizes the various terms of her analysis with localized meaning (*lesbi, tomboi, cowok, cewek*, etc.) as well as reminding the reader of the complexities of applying internationally known terms (*lesbian, gay, transgender*) to a population that does not fit the model of Western sexual identity.

Blackwood uses the following chapter to lay the groundwork for the rest of the book with an examination of several lines of knowledge production including contemporary Indonesian discourses of the state, Islamicist clerics, and the media. The remaining chapters describe how lesbi have responded to, negotiated with, and reconstituted these hegemonic discourses. To accomplish this goal, Blackwood includes discussions surrounding such topics as the cultural processes of gender acquisition, questions of transgender identities, and the consequences of asymmetrical transnational flows of queer knowledges. Among the highlights of this text is Blackwood's close attention to and deep analysis of language. In addition to the careful delineation of terms throughout the text, she makes language the center of chapter 4, "Doing Gender," in which she examines how tombois produce, maintain, and negotiate their gendered subjectivities, particularly through the use of various language strategies in everyday settings. Also of note is how her anthropological engagements illustrate the diverse cultural and political implications of globalization at the national and local level, which makes possible her more subtle interpretation of sexual cultures in non-Western, non-Anglophone settings.

Blackwood's writings on sexuality and gender in the context of Southeast Asia are well known. *Falling into the Lesbi World* is a welcome expansion and update of this body of work and represents an important theoretical contribution. The author's ability to interweave theory with ethnographic examples, her attention to detail, and a self-reflexive writing style combine well to support her central theses. With *Falling into the Lesbi World*, Blackwood succeeds at bringing her reader into the world of tombois and girlfriends in Padang. In doing so she offers a solid contribution to the field that will appeal to specialist readers and anyone interested in the anthropology of sexuality and gender as well as related fields such as Southeast Asian studies, gender studies, and queer studies.

Love in the Time of AIDS: Inequality, Gender, and Rights in South Africa. Mark Hunter. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2010. 324 pp.

JANET WOJCICKI

University of California, San Francisco

Mark Hunter's *Love in the Time of AIDS: Inequality, Gender, and Rights in South Africa* is an ethnography of gender and sexuality in Mandeni, an area north of Durban in the South African province of KwaZulu/Natal. Hunter states that Mandeni is the "AIDS Capital of KwaZulu/Natal" as it has the highest prevalence of HIV in South Africa, the country with the notable distinction of having the greatest number of people living with HIV/AIDS. Framing the ethnography in this context, initially the book holds great promise.

Hunter sets the stage for his ethnography in Mandeni to tell a story about South Africa as a whole as to why "AIDS emerged so quickly in South Africa" (p. 28). Key to his argument is what he describes as the "materiality of everyday sex" (p. 28), situated in a number of historical processes that have impacted sexuality and gender relations in South Africa including "racialized land dispossession, industrial growth and decline, the building of a formal African township, the rise of informal shack settlements and extreme population mobility" (p. 28).

The ethnography is at its strongest and most insightful when Hunter explores the intricacies of love and gender through detailed ethnography such as the inclusion of love letters and text messages and families' reactions and individuals to death and dying in the context of HIV/AIDS. He also skillfully illuminates the uniqueness of political events in South African's history such as the development of the new constitution in the postapartheid period, which included protection of rights of sexual orientation. According to Hunter, these revolutionary changes may have polarized some South Africans against Thabo Mbeki, leading to support for the populist Jacob Zuma, who challenged the "Africanness" of same-sex sexual desire (p. 175). Hunter's use of the isiZulu language is also particularly refreshing, including the detailed discussion of the terms *isoka* (a man with many girlfriends) and *isifebe* (a prostitute or woman with many male partners), in the context of his descriptions of gender and sexual relationships.

However, the book falls short as it never fully delves into the major issues concerning HIV/AIDS in South African in the 1990s and 2000s, such as the low use of condoms among women and problems of sexual violence. Hunter makes the point that most relationships involve some feelings of love, and condomless sex is better characterized as loving sex as an explanation for the scarcity of condom use. However, this reasoning contradicts the discussions that Hunter has about secondary partners that are often used only for

economic means, although he acknowledges that there are feelings of love and caring even in these heavily materialistic relationships.

The discussion of South Africa's youth-focused loveLife intervention program is brief as is his discussion of transactional sex, gang rape, and Thabo Mbeki's refusal to make the link between HIV and AIDS. Hunter concludes that the loveLife program only targets the English-speaking middle class, and that transactional sex in South Africa represents "shockingly high levels of inequality and unemployment . . . results in everyday intimate relations being highly material" (p. 200) and that gang rape is "a violent way men seek to straighten women" (p. 173). Thabo Mbeki's failure to make the vital connection between HIV and AIDS is explained by Hunter as a challenge to "Euro-centric approaches to the pandemic" (p. 222). While the above mentioned components of the HIV/AIDS epidemic in South Africa are broached and discussed in part, the ethnography should have explored these issues more comprehensively, given the opening premise to untangle the reasons for the emergence of an accelerated HIV epidemic in South Africa.

Hunter spends a sizable portion of the book discussing land issues, movement, migration, and labor as well as the types of housing available in the apartheid and postapartheid periods. In part, Hunter's attention to the historical context of migration and labor builds his main argument, which has a strong materialist and labor-based component. He concludes that the South African AIDS pandemic "is rooted not only in apartheid or in an abstract 'gender inequality' but in the reconstitution of intimacy as a key juncture between production and reproduction in a period of unemployment" (p. 219). While he takes care to situate the ethnography in South Africa's historical context, his efforts are excessive at the expense of providing deeper context for other factors at play in fueling the HIV epidemic such as South African sexual violence (Jewkes 2010). This is perplexing as he begins the book with a discussion of the rape trial of Jacob Zuma, then deputy president of South Africa and Hunter's question, "How did . . . a man charged with rape . . . become so popular in a country that overthrew the most oppressive . . . system of racial rule apartheid?" (p. 1). Hunter never fully answers this question.

Hunter's conclusion that violence serves as a way "to straighten women" is particularly underdeveloped. He should have explored the roots of statistics that suggest a particularly high rate of sexual violence in South Africa and possible associations with increased risk for HIV infection (Jewkes and Abrahams 2002; Jewkes et al. 2010).

Hunter concludes the book with the statement: "But while biomedical interventions have transformed key aspects of AIDS, the social roots of this disease remain stubbornly in place" (p. 225). Meanwhile, however, his final conclusion contrasts with his dynamic view of historical processes and change particularly with regard to gender and

sexuality. Along these lines Hunter states, "gender's constant restlessness, over the last fifteen years (in relation to) a variety of developments—the AIDS crisis, the creation of a modern constitution espousing equality, the appearance of many negative media images—have forced masculinities to shift in new ways" (p. 220). Hunter leaves us with a grim forecast for the possible amelioration of public health issues such as HIV/AIDS in South Africa in spite of increased access to antiretroviral treatments because of lack of change in socioeconomic conditions among South African's poorest groups. While it is true that South Africa continues to face an excessively high prevalence of HIV, particularly in lower socioeconomic status communities, a more detailed discussion of interventions including those social ones to address violence against women and economic development programs could have provided some glimpse as to where the epidemic is going in South Africa and possibilities for the future.

References cited

- Jewkes, R.
2010 Gender Inequities Must Be Addressed in HIV Prevention. *Science* 329(5988):145–147.
- Jewkes R., and N. Abrahams
2002 The Epidemiology of Rape and Sexual Coercion in South Africa: An Overview. *Social Science and Medicine* 55(7):1231–1244.
- Jewkes R., K. Dunkle, M. Nduna, and N. Shai
2010 Intimate Partner Violence, Relationship Power Inequity, and Incidence of HIV Infection in Young Women in South Africa: A Cohort Study. *Lancet* 376(9734):41–48.

Liberalization's Children: Gender, Youth, and Consumer Citizenship in Globalizing India. *Ritty A. Lukose.* Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2009. 304 pp.

MEENAKSHI THAPAN

Delhi School of Economics

This book makes a refreshing contribution to the field of youth studies in India, much of which is dominated by literature on adolescents and their problems from a psychological perspective. Lukose takes the problem of "locality" as central to her understanding of youth in an undergraduate college in Kerala in the context of globalization and changing identities. Her choice of Kerala as the larger frame in which to locate her ethnographic site is excellent precisely because of its place in developing India: it lies at the heart of theorizing about development, enshrined as a model to be emulated by other states in India. In fact, the process and consequences of "development" are rather complicated and shaped largely by local circumstances, traditions, and everyday life. Lukose rightly questions the assumption that by increasing education levels in Kerala, it is placed in an envious position vis-à-vis women's rights and their position in society. Lukose foregrounds

the changes in the position of women in Kerala as a consequence of education, social reform movements, and globalization. These changes do not necessarily point to an upward swing in the position of women and, in fact, suggest an ambivalent and distinctly marked terrain for women. In addition, migration out of the state has played a key role in defining the contexts within which youth in Kerala find themselves: an expansion in education has not necessarily resulted in a simultaneous expansion of the job market, and large numbers of educated youth are therefore without employment. This has resulted in a large push out of the state for livelihood opportunities elsewhere. At the same time, migration results in higher levels of education of the children of migrants who are left behind in Kerala; it is a circular movement, of migration resulting in higher levels of education of youth in their families leading to greater levels of outward migration. Migration, in turn, has an enormous impact on the lives of all youth whether or not they migrate: at a psychological level, it affects their aspirations and its practical outcomes are important: the remittances, the expansion of education, the commodity culture, and the restructuring of families and intergenerational relations.

The chapters in the book that follow the initial framing of Lukose's study and argument are fascinating for their nuanced ethnographic detail, incisive analysis, and the sympathetic anthropological manner that frames it. The relationship between gender and consumption is of particular interest; Lukose shows us how in-house beauty contests and fashion shows are ways through which the young women in the college represent themselves, "do" gender, perhaps set them apart from the more "modern girls" in metro cities. To my mind, the beauty or fashion show is one way of engaging with a sexual self publicly, wearing outrageous clothes for a college hostel fashion show that young women cannot publicly wear and through excessive caricaturing and representation, simultaneously indicating that this is just a "show," thereby undermining the risk of transgression. Transgression is taboo and remaining "demure" while modern is perhaps ideal; Lukose provides an interesting example of a young woman who is subjected to rebuke from her peers simply because she is viewed as having transgressed the borders of class and caste hierarchy having learnt Bharatnatyam, worn *churidars*, and has an uncle who is a migrant. As Lukose suggests, this example clearly indicates that the "demure modern" is an exclusionary space and leads to the production of locality at the "unstable boundary" between "tradition" and "modernity." Womanhood in India is riddled with complexities and the most ambiguous representation of Indian womanhood lies perhaps in the contemporary moment that is always in this confused space between tradition and modernity precisely because there never can be a complete movement outside tradition for fears of transgression that Lukose so evocatively alludes to.

Globalization impacts local processes in vastly different ways and is in itself not viewed as problematic. It is only when it is seen to challenge patriarchal norms of subjectivity–sexuality–the good Hindu woman, that it is viewed as taking on problematic characteristics. Lukose deftly portrays the complex ways in which ideas and practices emerging from an increasingly consumerist world fashioned by globalization, inflect young people's dreams and desires, whether to find a marriage partner, or fantasize about "romance" and "love," or learn to being *chethu*, combined with *ash-push*, all of which symbolize a way of being, an existential reality. If all this depicts a passive view of Indian youth, mindlessly swallowing up the consequences of globalization, Lukose discusses the role of "student-citizens" in the college. Through an analysis of events in the college, she concludes that students are in fact actively engaged in being "agents" of development as opposed to the conventional perception of them as mere "objects" of the educational system and thereby of development.

Lukose's writing provides us with an extraordinary combination of vivid images interwoven with a reality embedded on the firm ground of undergraduate college and hostel life in a small town in Kerala. The book seeks to go beyond conventional understandings of education as that perfect transformatory space leading to social and economic development. Instead, it opens up the ways in which we can seek to examine the linkages between education and young people's lives in a rapidly developing and changing society through an understanding of the dreams, aspirations, and everyday lives of youth. It also foregrounds "locality," inflected by caste, gender, particular histories, politics, tradition, and individual desires as being central to understanding the multifaceted linkages between youth and globalization in contemporary India.

Nostalgia for the Future: West Africa after the Cold War.
Charles Piot. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2010.
200 pp.

BRUCE WHITEHOUSE
Lehigh University

Are West African societies poised for a cultural revolution of unprecedented scope? This question underlies Charles Piot's latest study of cultural dynamics in Togo. While his previous book, *Remotely Global*, explored the historical interweaving of tradition and modernity in a rural Kabre community, *Nostalgia for the Future* considers the state of Togolese society and culture, both in the northern Kabre homeland and in the cities of southern Togo, since the early 1990s. The lives of Togolese have been transformed during this period by the decline of the state, the transition to multiparty politics, the ascent of neoliberalism as a global

discourse, and the flourishing of Pentecostal churches. All of this has brought about what Piot describes as “a seismic shift in the lives of Togolese” (p. 14); established beliefs and institutions, many of which had long enjoyed the protection of the colonial and postcolonial state, are being abandoned in favor of new, inchoate regimes of politics and personhood. Rupture would appear to be the order of the day.

Piot’s analysis of this rupture is grounded in Togo’s history and political economy. In the first chapter he traces the dynamics of state sovereignty in the waning years of rule by President Gnassingbé Eyadéma, a time marked by political unrest, electoral fraud, the retrenchment of Western political patronage and development aid, and a growing air of uncertainty about the future—which has only grown following Eyadéma’s death and replacement in 2005 by his son Faure Gnassingbé. Today, Piot writes, “unlike during the time of Eyadéma, when everything went through the dictator, no one knows who is in charge” (p. 48). Unable to rely on the state, Togolese now look to NGOs, Pentecostal churches, and the prospect of emigration to the West.

This has come at great cost to existing Togolese political systems and hierarchies, as Piot shows in chapters 2 and 4. His fieldwork in both rural and urban communities (including Accra, Ghana, as well as Lomé, Togo) reveals how Pentecostalism has reshaped governmentality from the ground up. Multiethnic, antiauthoritarian congregations provide a new model for political engagement in the cities, while rural believers’ efforts to make a radical break with their personal and collective past bypass local rituals and authority figures. Piot sees this movement as largely endogenous and, therefore, invested with tremendous power to transform lives. “I am moved by the extraordinary energy I have seen in the new churches in Accra and Lomé. Amidst poverty and abjection beyond belief, believers are filled—as if seized—with a sense of agency and possibility,” he writes, qualifying Pentecostal Christianity’s growth in West Africa as “a cultural production of stunning proportions” (p. 76). Even the popularity of youth-oriented NGO projects—the focus of the book’s fifth chapter—signals an approach that values the future, not the past.

As significant as such developments are, readers familiar with recent ethnographic research from Africa will find little that is entirely new in Piot’s descriptions. The retreat of the state, the proliferation of NGOs, the burgeoning of Pentecostalism, epidemics of witchcraft, and cultures of deception have been explored by numerous scholars since the 1990s, and Piot’s analysis of these phenomena owes much to Peter Geschiere, Ruth Marshall, and, especially, James Ferguson. Chapter 3, entitled “Exit Strategy,” does provide a rare, engaging glimpse into the cat-and-mouse games between U.S. consular officials and African visa applicants intent on seeking their fortunes abroad. Through the eyes of Kodjo, an enterprising Togolese “fixer”

who shepherds clients through the green card visa lottery’s application and interview process, we observe multilayered schemes to fabricate identities, marriages, and, indeed, whole families out of false documents in a desperate bid to win coveted U.S. immigrant visas. In a society now thoroughly dependent on migrant remittances—another common characteristic of African economies since the 1990s—the emergence of what Piot calls a “culture and imaginary of exile” (p. 3) has fundamentally altered its people’s relationship to the world beyond Togo’s borders.

Perhaps what is freshest about Piot’s approach, however, is the way he presents transnational migration, Pentecostalism, post-development governmentality, and fears of the occult as part of a single sociopolitical field undergoing radical, possibly epochal transformation. Philosopher Olufemi Taiwo recently coined the term *sociocryonics*, referring to “the frozen preservation of outmoded and moribund social forms” in African societies (2010:80); Taiwo blames European colonial administration for imposing this sociocryonic regime, thereby blocking Africa’s path to modernity. Piot, for his part, sees in the Togolese rejection of custom the seeds of the old regime’s destruction. One could understand this turning away from tradition, he suggests, as “attending to the unfinished business of national liberation and the end of colonialism” (2010:7).

Piot’s analysis sacrifices depth for breadth: nearly any one of these chapters might have been the basis of a monograph, and even in their abbreviated form they could all serve as stand-alone readings. If *Nostalgia for the Future* suffers from its broad scope, and occasionally from its author’s efforts to dress up his analysis in current social theory, it succeeds in depicting the moment in which millions of West Africans now find themselves, a moment laden with danger but also new senses of possibility. Like the Togolese he describes, Piot makes a deliberate choice to remain open to these emergent possibilities but does not lose sight of the challenges and contradictions that remain. In this regard, *Nostalgia for the Future* hints that anthropology itself is at a critical juncture. Just as Togolese are reconciling their desire for the new with the oppressive legacy of colonial and postcolonial history, anthropologists (esp. Africanist ones) must adapt their theoretical paradigms to a world in which the people we study may no longer valorize their local culture and identity but, instead, fashion new selves around heart-felt claims to global membership.

References cited

- Piot, Charles
1999 *Remotely Global: Village Modernity in West Africa*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Taiwo, Olufemi
2010 *How Colonialism Preempted Modernity in Africa*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

Wild Sardinia: Indigeneity and the Global Dreamtimes of Environmentalism. Tracey Heatherington. Seattle: University of Washington Press, 2010. xxii + 238 pp., appendix, notes, references, index.

AARON M. LAMPMAN

Washington College

During the 1990s the powerful eye of global environmental conservation settled its gaze on the Italian island of Sardinia in the Mediterranean. Under the guiding hands of disparate institutions including the European Union, the Italian government, and the World Wildlife Foundation, a long-lost plan to create a fortress-conservation-style national park was revived. The central highlands of Sardinia were targeted for conservation because they housed some of the only remnants of old-growth Mediterranean oak forest and contained numerous endemic and endangered species. The only problem for the conservation plan: local people have occupied the lands of the proposed park for centuries. The people of the infamous shepherd-bandit town of Orgosolo, who vigorously opposed the expropriation of their commonly held land for the creation of a conservation park, once again found themselves cast as the black sheep of modern Europe. This is the stage for the richly detailed ethnographic case study by Tracey Heatherington, which expertly weaves an insightful analysis of global environmental hegemony; attendant cultural essentialisms; and the negotiation of authenticity, authority, and identity in relation to contested landscapes.

Grounded in the theoretical framework of political ecology, the beginning chapters lay the foundation for later, more thorough, exploration of the key themes of ecology, alterity, and resistance. Heatherington argues that despite recent attempts to include local perspectives, Western global environmentalism champions specific universalizing visions of conservation that reify ideas of pristine wilderness, environmental “risk,” fortress conservation, economic development, scientific knowledge, and institutional management. As a specific way of constructing reality, these environmental visions constitute a hegemony that undermines the status of local knowledge and authority, erodes indigenous sovereignty over the landscape, and reproduces a colonial legacy of “ecological alterity.” Although it is problematic to call rural Sardinians “indigenous,” they do have a long history of colonization, social and economic marginalization, deep attachments to the specific landscape, and a thriving agropastoral heritage. Thus, when local Sardinians “resist” conservation efforts, they find themselves cast ever deeper into the quagmire of alterity through ever more strategic representations of their otherness in politics and the media.

Part 2 examines the multiple visions of Sardinian ecology that coexist in the minds of different groups and im-

part discourse about both nature and culture. The global environmentalist vision portrays the Sardinian highlands as a fragile ecosystem of high biological value that must be managed by experts. The nationalist vision sees institutional conservation of this landscape as a potential source of ecocodevelopment and a symbolic testament to modern Italian identity as a progressive country with “green” values. The local vision incorporates a deep sense of history, community, and living agropastoral attachment to the landscape, creating an embodied experience that imbues the residents of Orgosolo with moral authority to manage the land. As these different narratives collide at the crossroads of conservation, Heatherington shows how they affect perceptions of legitimate authority over environmental management.

Part 3 explores how global processes of cultural production have inscribed Sardinian people with a mantle of ecological alterity, reducing their multidimensional subjectivities to flat, simple, and politically powerful forms. Objectifying caricatures of Sardinians stem from a long history of fierce resistance to colonization; structural inequality and economic marginalization; a romanticized shepherd stereotype; and historical incidents of banditry, kidnapping, and violence. In media, politics, and international environmental discourse, Sardinians are alternately portrayed as illiterate, dangerous, culturally backward brigands, or exotic, untainted, egalitarian embodiments of an almost lost European pastoralist utopia. Ironically, local attempts to challenge these stereotypes often create a double-bind in which romantic or barbaric versions of the Sardinian reemerge again and again. These cultural essentialisms, Heatherington argues, are forms of ecological racism that invest authority in nonlocal parties to engage in governance over the local landscape.

Using specific ethnographic examples, part 4 goes much deeper than painting a simple, heroic picture of monolithic community “resistance” to a national park. The truth is much more complicated, as a national park would have different impacts on the different social categories in Sardinia. Using historicity as a framework, Heatherington examines how different actors involved in the debate use social agency and political practice to respond to the park proposal, variously interpreting, renegotiating, appropriating, and transforming their particular approaches to “resistance” according to the conditions of their lives. In doing so she analyses how gender, political orientation, occupation, personal history, and religious affiliation all impact the complex and varied forms of “resistance” that emerge in the political discourse of local Sardinians as they combat the creation of the park.

In the concluding chapters Heatherington examines the paradoxes of advocacy and the possibilities for “post-environmentalisms” that could enrich and empower global conservation. Utilizing a reflexive narrative style not present

in the preceding chapters, she reveals her struggles in dealing with the ambiguities of Sardinian cultural ecology and explores the question of whether her own work could unintentionally reify the secondary status of the Sardinian people. These self-reflections highlight a larger debate about whether anthropological approaches are powerful enough to change the universalisms and essentialisms found in global environmental movements. She concludes that anthropology has a role to play in purging ecological alterities by making visible the complex ways in which environmental power and knowledge are negotiated. Her own work is a shining example of what she advocates in the end: more nuanced political ecologies and more equality of participation that gives power to local communities to engage in environmental management. This detailed and well-written case study is a must-read for anyone interested in political ecology, environmental justice, the anthropology of resistance, and cultural politics.

Online a Lot of the Time: Ritual, Fetish, Sign. Ken Hillis. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2009. 316 pp.

ILANA GERSHON

Indiana University

Ken Hillis has written an engaging philosophical exploration of the dilemmas confronting Euro-Americans when they begin to use online communication. He is intellectually generous to anthropologists and their conceptual impulses, exploring a series of questions that can aid ethnographers interrogating Euro-American media ideologies surrounding new media. Hillis begins by asking how rituals in virtual space function to provide much-longed-for order in contexts when everything is in flux. He suggests that people use familiar techniques, such as ritual practices, to create predictability, especially when faced with newness. Yet when the new context is virtual, all sorts of widespread beliefs that underpin ritual practices are challenged and must be thought through in innovative ways. Hillis focuses in particular on commonly held Euro-American beliefs about how material objects and desire intermix (i.e., fetishes) and commonly held Euro-American beliefs about how signs point to reality (i.e., theories of representation).

In turning to ritual as his starting point, Hillis argues that people everywhere are faced with the existential challenge of helping to “stave off the Void and the meaninglessness of existence it portends” (p. 71) through signifying performances that produce contingent but stable enough order. He suggests various practices that function as ritual ordering on the web (although anthropologists might wish for far more detail about these practices): memorializing the dead, church services involving avatars, virtual quests, and so on. These virtual rituals resemble offline rituals, especially in the ways that they function as naturalized ide-

ologies. Both virtual and offline rituals contain logics that structure participants’ experiences but are not necessarily part of their daily awareness. Users may not understand the algorithms that shape an eBay auction, yet the auctions still function as effective ritual ordering. For Hillis, this becomes an essential component of how all these online rituals serve to affirm neoliberal subjectivities, encouraging affective and exchange relationships that serve to reinscribe neoliberal logics whether or not the users themselves wish to do so. He is critiquing the ways in which information machines, with their neoliberal assumptions, are increasingly becoming central to how people imagine rituals should take place. For example, virtual rituals encourage the desirability of a particular flexibility, in which one can conceive of oneself “as an image flexible enough to be located in multiple locations different from one’s embodied location” (p. 72). Hillis discusses how this flexibility, coupled with a commodified form of self-presentation on the web, ends up encouraging users to adopt neoliberal perspectives. In short, Hillis argues that the naturalized ideologies of the internet shaping the rituals analyzed in the book are neoliberal, and his larger task is contributing to a critique of the role information machines play throughout the Internet in encouraging neoliberal practices and ideas.

Given that neoliberal ideologies are his target, Hillis not surprisingly turns to fetishism online as the next conceptual knot to untangle. He argues that our own philosophical traditions about fetishism turn an object’s virtuality into a conundrum for scholars that it is not for users. He summarizes the long theoretical tradition that discusses how central materiality is to the objects that are fetishized. It is not only materiality, of course, but also the ways in which fetishism hinges on how objects are located in space, and located vis-à-vis other embodied objects. Hillis begins to unravel these assumptions by pointing out that space exists through contrast under virtual conditions just as much as it does in offline situations. He then goes on that virtual interactions depend on a dichotomy that presupposes offline experiences, that the virtual is compelling primarily because there is a dual component to the animation—there is someone offline using avatars or words to interact with others who also presumably have an offline anchor; “the belief that the Web constitutes a relational space fosters a belief in the ability to transmit a fragment of the self ‘elsewhere’ into virtual space where, as a sign/body, one will be experienced by oneself and others as having something of the qualities of an object-person coupled to those of a fetish-index” (p. 101). Hillis suggests that the well-theorized dual aspects of fetishism continue to function in virtual worlds, regardless of whether the object-person is material or virtual. Hillis argues that the “newness” of new media does not necessarily require new theoretical tools but, rather, an understanding of the contradictions within Euro-American philosophical theories of representation and materiality.

In the last part of the book, Hillis explores how gay men use webcams to engage with the paradoxes created by fetishism coupled with widespread homophobia. Why gay men? Both privileged as men and stigmatized as queer, gay men were early adapters of a technology that allowed them to be, in their own minds, both public and private about their sexuality and have a modicum of control over their fetishization. He points out how economically difficult being an early adapter (and, thus, early adapter) of webcams turns out to be. This was a serious, and often unsustainable, financial commitment as well as an aesthetic commitment on the part of these gay men. In addition, Hillis suggests that gay men have parts of their own ambivalent social status confirmed by the mechanics of virtual presence spatially. Virtually, as Hillis argues at numerous points in the book, one is always both online and embodied, virtual presence always involves a representational anchor elsewhere. Gay men face a similar situation temporally: denied full acknowledgment in the present moment, they orient toward a possible future of acceptance, of being fully acknowledged as present, always here and not here, now and not now. Lastly, gay men struggle with how their telefetish is always commodified. According to Hillis, in these instances, they are actively volunteering to be fetishized, which is both affirming and disquieting in equal measure. Hillis suggests that over time, this tension is unsustainable, and many gay men only volunteer to be fetishized for a certain period and then quit.

Online a Lot of the Time asks significant philosophical questions about how our theoretical traditions are challenged by online communication. Ethnographers may prefer concrete examples in which the nuances of the material are carefully explored. This book points the way to some ethnographic places to begin answering these very Euro-American questions.

Dreams That Matter: Egyptian Landscapes of the Imagination. Amira Mittermaier. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2011. 308 pp.

RUY LLERA BLANES

Institute of Social Sciences of the University of Lisbon
London School of Economics and Political Science

Reading the first pages of *Dreams That Matter*, when Ahmad, a public servant in a town in the Red Sea, sits with the author of this book and complains about the situation in Egypt (“The government used to steal our money,” he says, in the first sentence of the book), one cannot avoid mentally invoking what was to happen just a few months after the publication of this book: the Egyptian revolution that recently deposed the Mubarak regime in February 2011. From this perspective, the title of this

book seems somewhat prophetic, and is revealing of how ethnography can be historically relevant “by anticipation,” offering an anthropological portrait of the complexity of Egyptian life that helps the reader envisage the prerevolutionary situation. Adding to other fundamental and notorious references in the anthropology of Egypt (namely, Gilson, Mahmood, and Hirschkind, among others), Mittermaier opens the scope of reflection and analysis by incorporating an approach that speculates, using dreams and dream interpretation as foci, over an “anthropology of imagination”—taken here as a broad range of meanings, modes of perception, and configurations of the real (p. 3)—that adds a deeper layer of thought to the well-known debates on Islamic politics in Egypt.

However, using just the Tahrir Square events as an empirical framework to understand this book would be unfair for Mittermaier’s book, that was produced before the events and has much more to offer than an interpretive guideline for them. On the contrary, her description of the social agency (or “materialization”) of dreams in Egyptian life becomes an acute and trenching portrait of contemporary Egyptian politics, ethics, urban life, media practices, academic debates, religious and spiritual agency, and protagonism, ritual practices, and so forth.

With a fluid and elegant prose, Mittermaier develops, through what she calls an “attentive listening” (p. 10) and a collection of dream narratives (p. 21), a fascinating unraveling of the place and agency of dreams in contemporary Egyptian society, intersecting several stances of expression and action—from poetry to textual reading, prophesying, dream interpretation, television programs, journals, the Quran, and so on. Using her own personal background as a daughter of an Egyptian and a psychoanalyst, she “rebels” against a Western tradition of psychological anthropology (understood here in its philosophical sense) and plunges into the north African country to assert on the limitations of certain binary conceptualizations in this particular empiria. She then situates herself in and around Cairo, the Nile bridges, the City of the Dead, the Red Sea, and on the shrines of famous prophets and religious (mostly Sufi) specialists, where she reveals, through the negotiations and debates she encounters and participates in, fundamental differences between traditions and experiences of Islam. For this, she is guided by four *shaykhs* (scholars or Sufi spiritual advisers) who, through their individual charismatic personalities, leadership commitments, and dream interpretations, unfold on her different versions of authority, social relevance, morality, and practice.

From this perspective, despite spending most of the book describing the life and work of the shaykhs in the shrines, Mittermaier keenly avoids the pitfall of encapsulating her analysis solely within the religious sphere, broadening her scope to show the reader how dreaming and its interpretation participates in several planes of significance

and ideology and involves different notions of heuristics, knowledge, materiality, and morality that flow in and out of secular and religious categorizations. As she recalls in her introduction, “almost everyone had a dream to tell or an opinion about why dreams should or shouldn’t matter” (p. 22). With this kind of approach, Mittermaier increases the theoretical depth of her proposal, that is, ultimately, a critical contribution to psychological anthropology.

If there is anything to be missed in this wonderful book, it’s a more explicit discussion of the notion of “landscape,” as is explored by other anthropologists concerned with the interface between anthropology and psychology (namely, Tim Ingold), which could add further interrogations regarding perception, aesthetics, sensoriality, and imagination. However, Mittermaier’s anthropology of imagination (see pp. 16–20) is sufficiently compelling so as not to require these complementary connections. Furthermore, through its “apprehension” of dreams, it is instructive for other scholars performing within ethnographies of intangible objects; however, it does not speak, even if to decry it, to an important set of debates that stem from the intersection between anthropology and phenomenology. Also, as we move along the book, into dreams and landscapes, and understand their political implications, perhaps a discussion of the concept of “ideology” (taken here generally as sets of ideas, expectations, and actions—the core that underlies narrative and discourse) could have added even more interesting points to the analysis. But these last comments do not, ultimately, refer to hypothetical shortcomings in the book; rather, they stem from the intellectual stimulation provoked by reading it.

Dilemmas of Modernity: Bolivian Encounters with Law and Liberalism. Mark Goodale. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2009. 245 pp.

MIRIAM SHAKOW

Vanderbilt University

In *Dilemmas of Modernity*, Mark Goodale argues that, contrary to the common perception that epochal shifts have occurred in Bolivia with the advent of neoliberalism in the 1980s and the election of Evo Morales in 2005, liberalism has in fact remained a consistent, central organizing in Bolivian society since Independence in 1825. Describing liberalism as a multifaceted “pattern of intention,” Goodale examines the life of the law in Alonso de Ibañez, a rural province of 25,000 people in the North of Potosí region.

This book is an important read for scholars who are attempting to unpack the discrepancy between the utopian goals and often horrific effects of liberalism. For example, in Bolivia, liberal elites in the late 19th century orches-

trated the mass dispossession of indigenous people from their land in the name of individual rights and private property. Goodale sets out to show the unusual centrality of law in shaping Bolivians’ identities and actions, most recently as expressed in human rights discourse. He argues that the widespread enthusiasm for human rights as a framework for justice is tragically limited, as human rights represents a moralizing, and colonial, discourse. Elite human rights activists from outside the province define human rights rigidly and narrowly, bypassing a rich array of indigenous and syndicalist community-oriented political frameworks. Furthermore, Goodale asserts, human rights frameworks put the onus of responsibility on individuals to effect societal change by recognizing their own self worth, rather than emphasizing the collective organizing that is necessary to truly redistribute wealth and power in Bolivia. Goodale finds that human rights have failed in the region, as evidenced by women’s scarce opportunities to pursue legal remedies for violence against them, the large number of residents’ cases that languish in the provincial court, and persistent malnutrition and untreated chronic diseases.

In chapter 1, Goodale introduces many Bolivians’—and foreigners’—views of the North of Potosí as bound by static indigenous tradition that stands in direct opposition to liberal modernity (“How cold, how barbarous!”) (p. 8). Goodale counters, however, that the region is as much part of the flow of economic history as the rest of the country and that its residents are as enraptured by liberalism as other Bolivians. Goodale traces several important social categories and theoretical frameworks that have guided Bolivians, which he argues are all formed in direct response—although sometimes in opposition—to liberalism (pp. 13–14). To describe how Bolivians, including *nortepotosinos*, combine multiple identities and multiple theories of political action, Goodale invokes the geological metaphor of strata “which coexist uneasily and indefinitely” (p. 14). These multiple class–race identities and political frameworks lead many residents, on the one hand, to share the elite view that liberal law and human rights occupy a higher evolutionary level than community-based law while, on the other hand, believing in the efficacy of community based norms such as restitution for crimes in place of incarceration. Goodale explains his approach as tracing how “people . . . find meaning and dignity at modernity’s ragged edges,” which they do, in part, by theorizing “the transformative power of liberalism” (28). Goodale suggests, however, that the central dilemma of modernity in this poorest region of one of the world’s poorest and unequal countries is that the “benign” elements of liberalism, such as human rights, are inextricably intertwined with the damaging free marketization of the economy and a pernicious individualism that blocks the redistribution of wealth and power (p. 29).

In chapter 2, Goodale argues that, to rectify critical omissions in sociolegal approaches to law, it is important to examine how Bolivians commonly view law as a triumph of reason, even while he himself maintains that law is instead produced through unequal social relationships rather than universal rationality. He thus declares his intention to “contextualize law at the same as [taking] law’s philosophical self-assertions seriously” (p. 36). Chapters 3, 4, 5, and 6 then employ this approach in tracing the clash between the “grandeur” of liberalism and its paltry material and social rewards for Bolivia’s poor and indigenous. In local courtrooms, in the inequality of women before the law, in human rights institutions, in televised mass media, and in nongovernmental development projects, successively, Goodale finds pervasive gaps between liberalism’s ideal of human freedom and the reality of stark inequality and injustice.

Goodale, unlike some more hopeful observers of recent Bolivian political shifts, argues that the Morales administration has not broken with the fundamental assumptions and practices, the “patterns of intention,” of liberalism. In its emphasis on legal rights, legal institutions such as the constitutional assembly, and state capitalism, Goodale argues that the first self-identified indigenous President in Bolivia’s history has maintained significant continuities with the past. While acknowledging that the period since Morales’s election has been characterized by “ambiguity and desperate hopefulness” (p. 162), Goodale also finds that the new government has maintained the dominance of liberalism, and therefore, given preeminence to legal approaches for reshaping Bolivian society.

Goodale provides many helpful analyses of incidents in Alonso de Ibanez, of NGO and legal documents, and of local and national legal institutions. His analyses of public settings and a few important incidents was very thorough and helpful—such as that of a father who struggled to bring charges against his son-in-law for beating his daughter. This book may not be suited for course adoption, however, because it lacks careful attention to the words of people who lived there and lacks detailed description of everyday social relationships. The book would have been enriched by more detailed ethnography, particularly to recount the dialogues between the author and his research consultants regarding their respective hopes and fears around liberalism and modernity in Bolivia.

In sum, this is a thought-provoking analysis of the paradoxes of liberalism from an anthropologist who has spent more than a decade of research in Bolivia. Goodale’s book is an important contribution to critical legal studies and will be read by scholars seeking to gain an ethnographic purchase on the ways in which ideas—liberalism and legalism—materially affect people’s everyday lives.

Gay Fatherhood: Narratives of Family and Citizenship in America. *Ellen Lewin.* Chicago. University of Chicago Press, 2009. 225 pp.

JARED McCORMICK

Harvard University

“Paul and Keith exchanged a knowing look and then Paul said, ‘Oh, we aren’t gay anymore. We pick our friends by what time their kids’ nap time is’ ” (p. 152). *Gay Fatherhood: Narratives of Family and Citizenship in America* sets out to explore the growing number of gay men, single or partnered, who become parents. The book questions what desires motivate bringing children into their lives as they traverse the “seemingly contradictory identities” (p. 34) of being gay and fathers. The men draw from both commonly held narratives of family in America while also forging new terrain of kinship and affinity.

The book follows these men as they navigate through the landscape of the political Right’s aversion to gay parenting and calls from the Left that having children is a sort of assimilation into a heteronormative ideal. Lewin takes aim at Queer culture, namely that the “effort to acquire what are defined as the indexical features of heterosexual life” could be a “betrayal of the very essence of queerness” (p. 6). The power of *Gay Fatherhood* is that it strives to present the perspective of these men, entangled in multiple narratives, and emphasizes not “what should exist” but, rather, “what actually animates real people’s lives” (p. 12). Thus, emergent from the ideological traces of the Left and Right is an emphasis on how these fathers make sense of becoming dads, conceive of their new role in society, and have altered their lives because of children.

Gay Fatherhood is not a “guide” to parenting nor is it an inspirational proffering of the subject. In previous work Lewin (1993) focused on lesbian mothers, and this research continues the view of the family as a site in which one can lay claim to citizenship. Each chapter successfully marries ethnographic encounters of fathers with larger theoretical implications from the study. The themes that continually surface rally around questions of kinship, consumption, nature, and family. For instance, acquiring children through foster care (less expensive but bureaucratically challenging), international adoption (more expensive and limited to certain countries), private adoption (yet more costly and rife with unforeseen pitfalls of negotiations), and other options in which surrogates—eggs are procured (most expensive) begin to show the breadth of choices that are available. Yet how men conceive of kinship and questions of relationality to their children is entangled in a complex set of questions concerning consumption. Faced with many economic and moral choices as they procure children a powerful thread from some men’s

account was to fall back onto notions of “nature” as a way to make sense and manage the process of acquiring and parenting the child. For instance, two partnered men’s choice to use a surrogate lays bare the values for what constitutes their family, “how genetic information can be interpreted in creating a family” (p. 71), and how validation of this familial unit depends on it being legible as such to the general public.

As each chapter unfolds the reader is left with groups of men seeking fatherhood from opposing contexts and geographical areas, and animated by contrasting desires. As a result, the work creates a dialogue of intersecting and overlapping questions concerning how these men understand fatherhood through recounting their lives. Another compelling question that underlies Lewin’s whole project is what it means to be both a “father” and “gay.” For Paul and Keith, from the opening line, they “aren’t gay” anymore—but at some point they were. Seemingly, being parents has recast what it means to be gay and part of this identity has been replaced, or superseded, by their new role as caregivers. Povinelli’s “incommensurability” (2001) is aptly deployed in these discussions of “who they are rather than what they do” (p. 160). Some fathers feel more gay because their child highlights the aberration of their status as gay men, especially when questions of resemblance or having two dads are raised. For other men, fatherhood made them feel less gay, as it tapped into normative ideals of “adulthood” and created a notch on their path to maturity or idealized masculinity. Yet there is a lurking absence of what is meant by “gay,” whose definition or understanding of “gay”? This is not entirely a shortcoming of the author, for it was not her project, but this work speaks to larger questions of what constitutes a gay identity or personhood and how one can recraft, recast, or jettison the term in light of fatherhood.

Likewise, I am left wondering the context of these fathers in the jagged political landscape that constitutes America. Being gay is contentious enough, let alone a gay father, but what of those experiences of men who are in more rural settings or less examined states? Finally, how might those men who were “fathers” before “gay fathers” factor into this landscape?

Gay Fatherhood places debates of “reproductive futurism” in new light (Edelman 2004) as these men present the complex and fraught roles of being and becoming fathers. As a man who is one day hopeful to be a parent, this book was compelling, timely, and spoke to the measureless joys of having children and the countless meanings that these men made from it.

References cited

- Edelman, Lee
2004 *No Future: Queer Theory and the Death Drive*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.

- Lewin, Ellen
1993 *Lesbian Mothers: Accounts of Gender in American Culture*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press.
Povinelli, Elizabeth
2001 *Radical Worlds: The Anthropology of Incommensurability and Inconceivability*. *Annual Review of Anthropology* 30:319–334.

Adopted Territory: Transnational Korean Adoptees and the Politics of Belonging. *Eleana J. Kim*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2010. xviii + 267 pp., notes, references, index.

BARBARA YNGVESSON

Hampshire College

Adopted Territory, Eleana Kim’s powerful and innovative book about Korean transnational adoption, brings both intellectual rigor and a fresh approach to the study of adoptive kinship. Its focus is on adult adoptees who were born or adopted between 1953 and 1986 and the emergence of what Kim calls a “transnational adoptee counterpublic”—that is, a social imaginary created through networks of adoptees in virtual and actual locations that has transformative potential in constituting new forms of sociality and personhood. A critical dimension of the concept of a counterpublic is that it exists in tension with a cultural dominant. Kim returns to this tension throughout the book, arguing that new forms of adoptee kinship and cultural citizenship are forged in a dialectical relationship with dominant epistemes of personhood and national belonging. In this way she brings her book into productive conversation with other anthropological literature on kinship in which origins, birth, genealogy, and blood are seen as simultaneously “radically contingent but also crucially constitutive of identity” (p. 87).

The book is organized in two parts. A first section situates Korean adoption in the context of the Korean War, a modernizing South Korea, and gendered and racialized forms of stratified reproduction that accompanied the political and economic transformations of the late 20th century. Against this background, Kim examines the emergence of adoptee kinship and cultural citizenship from shared experiences of alienation and not belonging. These experiences become the template for new forms of collective personhood that have taken shape at conferences held in different global locations, beginning with the first International Gathering of Korean Adoptees in Washington, D.C., in 1999. Similar conferences followed in Oslo and in Seoul in the first years of the 21st century, and Kim’s fieldwork involved participant-observation at these events and interviews with leaders and others. The second section of the book shifts focus to South Korea and the complex relationship of returning adoptees to the South Korean government and to Korean NGOs that

emerged over the past decade to assist them. That South Korea, ranked among the “lowest-low” fertility countries since 2001 and as the world’s 13th largest economy in terms of GDP in 2007, has also produced the world’s largest and most efficient international adoption program, one that at its peak in the 1980s (coinciding with the beginning of South Korea’s economic boom) was sending over 8,000 children in adoption overseas, is a particular irony for adult adoptees who return there to seek answers to the question, “Why was I adopted?”

Kim draws with insight and sensitivity on the narratives of her interlocutors to illuminate what she calls a “shared habitus produced out of common experiences of being ‘unnatural’ members of normative families” (p. 103) and of being simultaneously “inalienable and exchangeable” in South Korea, where adult adoptees are viewed as targets of that nation’s goal to consolidate a diaspora of long-distance belonging. This ambiguity of belonging—not belonging and the shared acknowledgment of the instability and uncertainty of origins constitutes what Kim calls “adoptee kinship,” or as she cogently puts it, “*the fact of adoption . . . constitutes a shared substance*” (p. 97, emphasis added), evoking earlier debates about the nature of shared substance in the kinship literature. The experience of shared substance, what one adopted Korean described as “I could be you, you could be him, he could be her” (p. 95) allows adoptees, Kim argues, to define themselves as “a separate ontological category of humans” (p. 86), a move that simultaneously essentializes adoptive identities as natural, while acknowledging their socially and culturally constructed nature.

This self-conscious collective redefinition of adoptee personhood and community over against dominant categories of race, family, nation, and belonging is a central aspect of Korean adoptee social practice, and creates the “adopted territory” of Kim’s title. This territory is both deterritorialized (it is constituted through new media technologies enabling adoptees in different global locations to imagine their community as a network) and it materializes in specific locations, such as the International Gatherings, in national associations of adopted Koreans, and in alternative spaces of belonging for the expatriate adoptee community in South Korea.

There is a productive tension in Kim’s analysis, one that is signaled in her framing of the imagined community created by Korean adoptee activists as a “counterpublic,” and her deployment of a series of terms—*contingent essentialism, disidentification, discrepant cosmopolitanism*, and so forth—to capture the emergent social formations that are her focus. Noting that counterpublics traffic not in rational-critical discourse recognized by the state, but in “expressive-poetic performances of corporeality” (p. 139) and acknowledging the difficulty in translating lived and embodied knowledge into an object of expert knowledge,

she skillfully negotiates the challenge of bringing research on adoption into conversation with a broader literature on kinship, citizenship, and belonging, while at the same time capturing the ways the experience of adoption calls into question the very categories we might use to make sense of it. A testimony to Kim’s nuanced portrayal of adoptee subjectivity is her inclusion in several chapters of descriptions of installations by adoptees—for example, “I Wish You a Beautiful Life,” which borrows its title from a popular adoption story but adapts it to an installation on Korean adoptee suicides, suggesting the contradictions that make adoption both good to think with and painful to live. Such artistic representations of “the dialectic of loss and gain” that adoptees inhabit (p. 19) suggest the key place of the expressive-poetic in capturing the ambiguous figure of the adoptee, and the relevance of such renderings to a politics that can address the structural violence that has produced the need for international adoption.

Adopted Territory concludes by returning to a theme with which it opens—the figure of the humanitarian orphan that inspired the earliest Korean adoptions. Kim argues that the grip of this figure on the popular imagination obscures its political origins as a form of “bare life” that can be included (as Agamben argues) only through an exclusion. The sentimentalized orphan, conceived by adoption agencies and child welfare professionals as in need of rescue, remains a powerful obstacle to contemporary efforts by adult adoptees to reframe the project of international adoption. This book offers a compelling argument for this reframing, one that uses the figure of the adoptee to radically interrogate the fundamental categories of the nation state and the forms of belonging it generates.

Customizing Indigeneity: Paths to a Visionary Politics in Peru. *Shane Greene.* Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2009. xvi + 244 pp.

ANDREW CANESSA
University of Essex

This book joins a growing number of works interrogating indigeneity as this very globalized concept is increasingly being taken up by communities around the world, usually in a struggle for their minority rights, but also by NGOs and development agencies who increasingly see indigenous people as prime recipients of development aid. Indigeneity is, without a doubt, a slippery and contentious concept, ultimately “vacant, essentially empty and yet universally theorized” (p. 15) as Greene puts it. Yet, even as the concept seems particularly problematic in Asia and Africa, in settler states such as Australia and Peru the distinctions

between who is and is not indigenous appear, it is often argued, clearer. Greene destroys this fallacy better than most, perhaps because he does not start with identifying indigenous people and conceptualizing identity from there but, rather, starts with a theoretical position on indigeneity and from this vantage point explores the ways that people such as the Aguaruna of Peru customize indigeneity in a meaningful way. Customization here is seen as both the specific acts of adapting to new cultural and political phenomena “and to a structural process of constrained activity” (p. 17).

For Greene, indigeneity “is a form of generically modern difference constructed on the model—and in the mirror—of generically modern sameness” (p. 15). How then to deal with indigeneity? His signal contribution is to see it in terms of a series of dynamics and articulations whereby indigeneity is “customized.” A vision of Amazonian society which is liberated from an atavistic lens and sees indigeneity as a resolutely modern condition allows for an analysis which sees the dynamism and creativity to processes of rapid and profound change. This is an important aspect of Greene’s work because (1) even as it eschews essentialisms, strategic or otherwise, it also avoids the trap of seeing indigeneity as a set of “hyperreal” simulacra developed in postmodern cyberspace; and (2) it allows for a model of indigenous agency which avoids seeing cultural change in terms of either assimilation or resistance. It also provides a constructive methodology for dealing with social change that avoids falling into a melancholic sense of cultural loss.

Change is everywhere among the Aguaruna and the warrior culture of old looks very different from the contemporary world but, still, contemporary Aguaruna wage “war” through the use of education and create a very Aguaruna modernity. Similarly, Greene explores the various ways in which Aguaruna concepts of space and time, paths and visions, are creatively customized to a different world even as new elements are customized to an Aguaruna reality. The process goes both ways.

One of the central themes running through the book is a set of arguments that Shane Greene has developed elsewhere, which is that contemporary Peru’s intellectuals, including social scientists and *indigenistas*, are guilty of an endemic “systemic ignorance” (p. 114) that, he argues, is not only because of the historic predominance of the Andes politically and culturally and a fascination with the Inkas but also an inheritance of the Inkas’ mistrust of lowland peoples they were never able to conquer. This is an important argument, and I am pleased Greene has developed it further in this book as much of the way Amazonian people see themselves as indigenous and Peruvian needs to be seen through this analytic lens. The most striking example of this is that the Peruvian state simply translated a model of in-

digenous relations from the Andes to Amazonia. In the late 1960s and early 1970s, Peru’s agrarian reform program was giving title to peasant indigenous communities founded on a land tenure system based on farming. At this time, most Amazonians were still engaged in slash and burn agriculture and were not generally settled in nucleated communities that Greene suggests in the Andes goes back to the 1920s but, in fact, has its roots in the Toledan reforms of the 16th century. In Greene’s words, “The state’s granting native community titles to these hunter societies more or less mandated that the Andeans’ agrarian past should become the Amazonians’ near-term future” (p. 135). Or, to put it in another way, the state attempted to impose an Andean indigeneity on Amazonians who were not, until this point, consciously indigenous at all; there was no sense of sharing an historical experience or cultural condition with highland peasants.

One of the direct manifestations of this difference between highlands and lowlands is the ways indigenous Amazonians regard bilingual education. In sharp contrast to the Andean region, where there were long struggles for education in Spanish to defend property and other rights, the Amazonian region’s education system was introduced in recent decades. First, it was introduced by the Summer Institute of Linguistics missionaries and then, close on their heels, by Jesuit missionaries. Consequently, formal education in Amazonia was always bilingual, and there is little of the ambivalence or outright antipathy one finds in Andean regions. The Aguaruna began to see themselves as indigenous through bilingual education, a process that shifted power away from older warriors to younger school teachers.

Shane Greene’s book will be an essential reference work for anyone involved in indigenous studies globally and most certainly for scholars of the Amazon. Greene writes well and often demonstrates a playful flair with language. He obviously has a thorough knowledge of Aguaruna society but what is striking is how few female voices come through the pages of the book. This may be because Aguaruna society was, until recently, a male-dominated shamanic warrior society and one of the book’s aims is to show how bellicose masculinity can be customized to a world where the written word is more effective than physical violence. In focusing his work on leaders and school teachers, I felt I missed the perspectives from Aguaruna who are followers rather than leaders and, in particular, from women. Leaders and teachers will simply have more scope to articulate an indigenous identity, so one is left wondering if indigeneity is customized equally or even in similar ways by everyone else. This remains, though, an imaginative, provocative, and, ultimately, compelling book that was a pleasure to read.

Fixing Sex: Intersex, Medical Authority, and Lived Experience. Katrina Karkazis. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2008. 365 pp.

PAMELA L. GELLER

University of Miami

With about 60,000 members, the American Academy of Pediatrics (AAP) is the United States' primary professional organization for pediatricians. The interests of AAP members are diverse, although all advocate for children's health and well-being. The organization's "Policy Statement—Ritual Genital Cutting of Female Minors," authored by its Committee on Bioethics, provides an illustrative and salient example:

The physical burdens and potential psychological harms associated with FGC violate the principle of nonmaleficence (a commitment to avoid doing harm) and disrupt the accepted norms inherent in the patient–physician relationship, such as trust and the promotion of good health. More recently, FGC has been characterized as a practice that violates the right of infants and children to good health and well-being, part of a universal standard of basic human rights. [AAP 2010:1089]

The message is unequivocal. Genital alterations that are indelible, invasive, and contingent on religious tenets or cultural aesthetics are reason for universal alarm. They disfigure physically, damage mentally, and dehumanize undoubtedly.

While Katrina Karkazis makes no mention of female genital cutting (FGC) in *Fixing Sex*, an examination of intersexuality's medical management, she certainly deepens understanding of genital surgery and its consequences. In contrast to their condemnation of FGC, pediatricians have deemed surgical treatment of children with ambiguous genitalia necessary despite "few long-term follow-up studies demonstrating the efficacy of these procedures" (p. 145). As Karkazis discovers through participant-observation of and interviews with clinicians, necessity is born not of medical imperative but, rather, out of socio-sexual norms. In addition to those who effect policies and procedures, Karkazis's ethnography gives equal consideration to those whose lives have been affected. According to intersex persons' own accounts, surgical alterations of genitalia have engendered embarrassment, anger, and political action. For these individuals, then, mutilation may be an accurate characterization of medical treatments. Accordingly, Karkazis conveys the complexities of "fixing sex" when intersex is the diagnosis.

Intersexuality has long presented a categorical conundrum for physicians. In part 1 of *Fixing Sex*, Karkazis details this history, tracking shifting understandings and the

emergence of standardized treatment. The latter occurred in the 1950s as a consequence of work by psychologist John Money and colleagues. Academics and popular authors alike have weighed in on Money's scientific legacy and role in the controversial case of David Reimer: "Even though Reimer did not have an intersex diagnosis," Karkazis writes, "his case had profound implications for the medical treatment and public understanding of intersexuality" (p. 68). Following a circumcision gone awry, Money advised Reimer's parents to raise him as a girl. Initially, this recommendation seemed sound, bearing out Money's theories about gender development. Subsequent sleuthing by Money's long-time critic Milton Diamond, however, revealed that Reimer had rejected his female identity at puberty. Reimer's identification as male indicated to Diamond that nature and not nurture undergirded psychosexual development.

Karkazis's review of the history and scholarly sources treads well-traveled ground. But, dissimilar from most other writers, she does not oversimplify biomedical theorizing about intersexuality and gender identity. She also lends the debate balance, identifying the strengths and shortcomings of researchers who work within and against the dominant paradigm. While Karkazis paints Money in a less demonic light, she does not go as far to make excuses for any scientists' conceptual or clinical deficiencies. As she reminds us, Reimer's story is ultimately a tragedy, his 2004 suicide a cautionary tale. Notions about psychosexual differences and development "are not simply academic arguments: treatment hinges on these theories" (p. 80). In this regard, feminist and queer scholars should take note. While intersexuality is good to think with—about embodiment, corporeality, gender, sexuality, and so on—theorizing about the issue must not be an end unto itself.

In part 2 of *Fixing Sex*, Karkazis considers the culture of medicine, focusing her sights specifically on clinicians' treatment of intersex. Health movements, she notes, have changed patient–physician relations over some five decades, and intersex persons have not been unaffected. For instance, to flesh out the 2006 "Consensus Statement on Management of Intersex Disorders," physicians invited patient input, and as a consequence, the document represents "a marked shift in thinking about treatment for intersex diagnosis" (p. 237). Yet Karkazis's investigation of medical practice, which extends past analytical emphasis on discourse, confirms that genital appearance continues to weigh heavy in decisions about gender assignment and heteronormative presumptions about sexuality. One doctor remarks, "If you're a woman with a big clitoris, you're likely to turn into a dyke. People never say it in that kind of a cruel, inappropriate way, but that's the association people make" (p. 149). Given such a homophobic reaction, it is unsurprising that the consensus statement recommends clitoral surgery in "severe" cases. Such counsel begs the question,

whose vision of corporeal norms is invoked? The answer is transparent, as Karkazis learns. Of enlarged clitorises, a doctor declares, “These girls don’t look right. It’s unsettling. It’s repulsive. You just cannot leave them looking like that!” (p. 147). It would appear then that the diagnosis and treatment of intersexuality, which physicians identify as a disease despite the consensus statement’s euphemistic usage of “disorders of sex development,” functions to alleviate cultural dis-ease with those who defy dichotomous categorization.

If self-reflexivity was the only thing sacrificed at the surgical knife’s edge, Karkazis’s findings would not be quite so distressing. Physicians’ sentiments about sociosexual relations and bodily ideals, however, ultimately sway the “choices” parents make for their children, as documented in part 3. This section also contains powerful statements from adults with intersex diagnoses. With few exceptions, most describe physical and psychological damages resultant from medical care and lack of consent—a compendium of closeted existences, lived experiences contoured by shame and alienation, bodily disfigurements, impeded erotic sensations, and fears of intimacy. Karkazis thus determines that contra to physicians’ hopes, their good intentions are not “synonymous with good outcomes” (p. 267). Rather, they pave the road to patients’ personal hells. And while not all who share their experiences in *Fixing Sex* are activists, their statements will certainly speak truth to power. Were medical authorities to engage with Karkazis’s important book, and I strongly recommend they do, they might recognize their latent hypocrisy and be humbled by their professional hubris.

Reference cited

American Academy of Pediatrics
2010 Policy Statement—Ritual Genital Cutting of Female Minors.
Pediatrics 125(5):1088–1093.

Patriotic Professionalism in Urban China: Fostering Talent. *Lisa M. Hoffman.* Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 2010. 206 pp.

PETER G. ROWE

Harvard University

Lisa Hoffman’s fascinating account of the emergence of urban professionals in China is based on extensive field study conducted between 1993 and 2003 in Dalian, a prominent city in the country’s north-east region. It begins, logically enough, by establishing some necessary theoretical groundwork and by defining important conceptual terms. Among these is “patriotic professionalism,” highlighted in the book’s title, which weds individual professional development with national projects of state strengthening, as

well as local projects of economic growth. Distinctions are also drawn between the central planning of the “high socialist era” in China and the self-enterprise and entrepreneurship of what Hoffman calls “late-socialist neoliberalism.” In this latter regard similarities and divergences with neoliberalism referred to more generally are also explored.

Chapter 2 takes up with recent attempts to reposition Dalian in transnational and domestic networks of economic development, shifting away from industry into the trade, finance, and tourism of the service sector, all with rising demands for new urban professionals. Here, then, Mayor Bo Xilai’s adoption of environmental and urban beautification projects are chronicled, modeled after efforts in Hong Kong and Singapore, along with Mayor Xia Deren’s later embrace of information technology.

Chapter 3 examines universities not only as training grounds for urban professionals but also as what Hoffman calls agents of state policies and directives. Commenting on changes that have occurred, various “red-expert debates” are analyzed, reaching back into the Maoist era’s mistrust of experts in contrast to today’s emphasis on expertise and professionalism. Throughout, discussion is suffused with interesting conversations with participants at job fairs, admission offices, and among career guidance counselors. Chapter 4 enlarges on the core idea of “patriotic professionalism” with effective presentation of ethnographic evidence. From this, Hoffman argues that college graduates adopt a self-enterprising ethos, as she puts it, but one that also reflects a sense of responsibility to the nation. Subtle distinctions are also drawn with Confucian “self-cultivation” and references are made to familial and other tensions arising from the processes of self development.

In chapter 5, the profitability of educated human capital is broached, again with compelling ethnographic material, especially coming from prospective employers. Here, discussion of the educational level, proper behavior, and quality of young professionals is particularly illuminating. Chapter 6 reveals both tensions and choices pursued involving risk and opportunity, on the one hand, and security and stability on the other. A common outcome is what Hoffman calls “one household and two systems,” with the husband taking risks in the outside business world and the wife working securely inside a state institution or similar, safe, long-term environment. Finally, in chapter 7, further commentary is offered on neoliberalism in China, particularly in the light of the recent global crisis.

Within the scope and tone of this book, Hoffman makes a number of noteworthy contributions. First, she provides insightful understanding in a well-reconciled manner regarding the otherwise apparent contradictions between participation in a free-market economy and following the dictates of the socialist state. The covering terminology used here of “patriotic professionalism” combines neoliberal concepts of “self-enterprise,” “autonomy,” and

“entrepreneurism” among urban professionals with concern for national well being. It stems, according to Hoffman, from the “late-socialist neoliberalism” emerging from critical reflections on Maoist-era governance that, in turn, differs from neoliberalism in the United States or Europe by marrying neoliberal methods of labor allocation involving processes like mutual choice and competition with “high socialist” sensibilities about the relationship between labor power and nation building. The net effect among young urban professionals is an identity that is both nonconflictual at a personal level and distinct, going some way to clarifying why so many in China these days seem cursorily like Western counterparts and, yet, are also clearly not like them entirely. Moreover, Hoffman’s interest in how specific neoliberal practices in education, guidance, recruitment, and employment of urban professionals combines with nonliberal norms in everyday activities makes this portrayal all the more vivid.

By extension, a second contribution is a more nuanced understanding of neoliberalism as such and one that is less exclusive than widely accepted definitions by spanning beyond solely Western circumstances. Here Hoffman also makes the rightful suggestion that the seemingly commonsensical correlation between talent and a global city’s prosperity is anything but natural or evolutionary and, in China, very much, as she puts it, a matter of governmental strategy and assemblage. What also emerges is a third contribution in the form of a relatively well-drawn portrait of the persona, if one can call it that, of China’s rising pro-

fessional middle class. Furthermore, if Hoffman is at all accurate in her portraiture, this is a substantially different social formation than has existed in China beforehand and one that again challenges accepted classifications of the “middle class.” Finally, although not overtly, Hoffman also contributes to the broadening perception of the rise of the municipal state in China. This comes through quite strongly in discussion of the autonomy enjoyed by Dalian relatively recently, the emphases on talent and strategies of local urban development, as well as in shifts of labor power more broadly toward individuals.

Misgivings about the book are few. There is an asymmetry of evidence amassed for neoliberal methods as against examples of tending to the nation’s well being. This in itself reveals a certain empirical or classificatory gap between the intimate detail of specific case narratives and broader theorizing. Reiteration of ideas like “patriotic professionalism” and its closely aligned big themes, but without much further nuance or details, is overly repetitive and assertive at times. Any sense of physical space is limited, especially when it comes to the aspirations of urban professionals, compared to what is on offer. Understandably, perhaps, given the book’s scope, no attempt is made to discriminate among the pushes and pulls on different professions and the tensions that might arise accordingly. All in all though, *Patriotic Professionalism in Urban China* is a valuable and worthwhile contribution to our understanding of contemporary China.